Training Toolkit on Effective National to Local Public Governance for SDG Implementation
National to Local Governance for Effective Health Emergency Management

Module 3.6
Learning Outcomes

- Strengthening governance capacities in the full process of preparedness, prevention, response and post-recovery to respond to health emergencies
- Strengthening emergency preparedness in order to ensure a timely, efficient and effective response to events
- Identifying the most probable health emergency related corruption risks, in order to mitigate those risks, prevent corruption, bribery and fraud and enhance integrity of public sector
- Understanding the Golden Hour- The Road to Recovery
- Learn about data-driven decision-making and digital government tools to manage health emergencies
I. Global Frameworks and Initiatives to Address Emergency Preparedness

- Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015 - 2030
- Pandemic influenza preparedness Framework for the sharing of influenza viruses and access to vaccines and other benefits
- United Nations Paris Climate Agreement
- Global Health Security Agenda
- UHC 2030 International Health Partnership
II. Principles for Health Emergency Preparedness

Safeguarding, maintaining and restoring the health and wellbeing of communities

Communities are critical for effective emergency management

Preparedness requires sustained political commitment, partnerships, and funding

Sustained funding should be aligned with costed, prioritized preparedness measures based on risk and capacity assessments

Health systems and emergency preparedness reinforce one another, and along with other systems contribute to the resilience of communities and countries

Emergency preparedness should be addressed with an all-hazards approach

Emergency risk management should continue to emphasize prevention measures to avoid hazards and reduce vulnerability

A whole-of-society approach is critical for emergency preparedness
# II. Principles for Health Emergency Preparedness (Cont.)

## Governance element of preparedness at all levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Governance</th>
<th>National/Sub-national/Local</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Policies and legislation that integrate emergency preparedness | • Integration of emergency preparedness in national health strategies and plans and financing  
• Multisectoral emergency risk management policies and legislation include health  
• Legislation for management of emergency situations (emergency powers) |
| Plans for emergency preparedness, response and recovery | • Intersectoral plans for emergency preparedness, response and recovery include health (e.g. national disaster management organizations, One Health)  
• National health emergency plans for preparedness, response and recovery  
• Multi-hazard, multisectoral exercise management programmes |
| Coordination mechanisms     | • Health coordination mechanisms and plans include relevant sectors, public, private and civil organizations, and other stakeholders across and between all levels  
• Emergency preparedness of public, private and civil society organizations in public health, animal health, environment, tourism, transport, water, emergency services, migration and other sectors  
• Public health emergency operations centers (PHEOCs) and incident management systems are established and integrated with multisectoral emergency operations centers (EOCs) and coordination mechanisms across all levels |
Module 3.6: National to Local Governance for Effective Health Emergency Management

II. Principles for Health Emergency Preparedness (Cont.)
III. Strengthening Governance Capacity

Sharing Knowledge
- Map the field of relevant actors
- Bridge knowledge gaps between science & policy
- Build diverse networks for knowledge sharing
- Create frameworks and platforms
- Provide incentives for sharing
- Balance national and local scales

Developing Communication
- Create multi-media platforms for risk awareness
- Cooperate with media partners
- Strengthen & streamline early warning platforms
- Innovate disaster risk awareness campaigns
- Bring health/disaster risk management into the classroom

Leveraging Investments
- Make the value of investments visible
- Connect politicians and affected communities
- Innovate existing disaster risk financing structures
- Create partnerships for investments with the private sector
- Make long-term political agreements

Harmonizing Capacities
- Map existing capacities
- Assess and balance capacities
- Match capacities to risks
- Evaluate and learn
- Create local partnerships
- Create continuity for capacities

Institutionalizing Coordination
- Clarify mandates for coordination
- Acknowledge the need for balance & flexibility
- Practice and exercise roles
- Set up coordination forums
- Align and streamline priorities
- Build partnerships for transboundary crisis management

Engaging Stakeholders
- Clarify the roles of stakeholders
- Create incentives for stakeholder participation
- Create web-based online platforms
- Locate mediator and experiment with roles
- Utilize LS knowledge for health crisis reduction actions
- Ensure sustained commitment

Effective coordination mechanisms between national and local governments are critical.

- **National coordination mechanism** may work on the ‘bigger picture’
- **Local coordination mechanism** may work more on the level of operational guidance and oversight of programme implementation
III. Strengthening Governance Capacity (Cont.)

Inter-agency coordination for emergency response in Korea

President

Office of National Security

Central Safety Control Committee Chair: Prime Minister

Safety Policy Coordination Committee Chair: MOIS

National Disaster and Safety Control Center

Accident Recovery Center

Infection Control & Prevention Center

Central Emergency Rescue Control Unit

Local government Emergency Rescue Control Units

Local government Disaster Safety Center

Situational reporting

Command & Report

Coordination & assistance

Sectoral ministries/Agencies

National administration & affiliated organizations Local branch

Source: OECD, 2020
III. Strengthening Governance Capacity (Cont.)

Communication to discharge accurate information

Producing and disseminating facts and accurate information
Partnering with businesses
Working with media and journalists
Mobilizing civil society
Digital platforms or apps to keep citizens informed

Implementing a social media-based crisis communications strategy

Identify a consistent hashtag
Be the voice of authority
Establish a rumor control website
Use several people to manage the flow of requests
Avoid social media scams
Implement a social media archiving solution
Choose a precise communications strategy in advance
### Five Priorities Action for Health Emergency

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>Emergency risk management for health as a national and local priority</td>
<td>![Handwash icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02</td>
<td>Health risk assessment and early warning</td>
<td>![Human icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03</td>
<td>Education and information to build a culture of health, safety and resilience at all levels</td>
<td>![Cross icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04</td>
<td>Reduction of underlying risk factors to health and health systems</td>
<td>![House icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05</td>
<td>Emergency preparedness for effective health response and recovery at all levels</td>
<td>![Ambulance icon]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IV. Anti-corruption Approaches in the Context of Health Emergency

“Corruption is criminal, immoral and the ultimate betrayal of public trust. It is even more damaging in times of crisis – as the world is experiencing now with the COVID-19 pandemic.”

The secretary-general - statement on corruption in the context of COVID-19
IV. Anti-corruption Approaches in the Context of Health Emergency

Health System Corruption Risks During Health Emergency

- Procurement of goods and services for disease management
- Petty corruption at the service delivery level
- Opacity and corruption in health workforce governance, recruitment, and management
- Opacity in research and development

Source: Steingrüber et al., 2020
IV. Anti-corruption Approaches in the Context of Health Emergency (Cont.)

Prevention of Corruption during the Health Emergency

- Enhance the integrity and accountability of public sector
- Public sector decisions and policies on Covid-19 related relief measures should be transparent and available to public.
- Ensure accountability and transparency in decision making
- Avoid conflict of interest in decision making
- Ensure clear and transparent procedures for the distribution of relief measures for private sector
- Reduce opportunities for bribery in administration
- Keep the records on all the procedures and procurement
- Protect the most vulnerable health sector
- Strengthen whistleblower protection
- Strengthen the monitoring, audit and oversight mechanisms
IV. Anti-corruption Approaches in the Context of Health Emergency (Cont.)

Accountability and the prevention of corruption in the allocation and distribution of emergency economic rescue packages in the context and aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic

1. Clear, Objective and Transparent Criteria for the Qualification of Intended Beneficiaries and Recipients

2. Account for the Risks and Vulnerabilities of Disbursement and Targeting Methods

3. Open Clear Communication and Outreach Channels to Raise Awareness and Understanding of Beneficiaries

4. Use of Technology for Efficient, Transparent and Accountable Disbursement of Resources

5. Comprehensive Auditing, Oversight, Accountability and Reporting Mechanisms to Monitor the Disbursement Process and Verify Appropriate Receipt

Source: UNODC (2020)
Some key UNCAC articles related to the COVID-19 response

Under the United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC), each State party shall:

**Article 5 (3):** Endeavor to periodically evaluate relevant legal instruments and administrative measures with a view to determining their adequacy to prevent and fight corruption

**Article 9 (2):** Take appropriate measures to promote transparency and accountability in the management of public finances [which] shall encompass, inter alia: (c) A system of accounting and auditing standards, and related oversight; (d) Effective and efficient systems of risk management and internal control

**Article 10 (b):** Take such measures as may be necessary to enhance transparency in its public administration, including with regard to its organization, functioning and decision-making processes, where appropriate. Such measures may include, inter alia: (b) Simplifying administrative procedures, where appropriate, in order to facilitate public access to the competent decision-making authorities

**Article 13 (1):** Take appropriate measures /…/ to promote the active participation of individuals and groups outside the public sector /…/ by such measures as: (a) Enhancing the transparency of and promoting the contribution of the public to decision-making processes; (b) Ensuring that the public has effective access to information
V. The Golden Hour – The Road to Recovery

1. Leadership
   • Build confidence in emergency response and potential recovery strategies
   • Establish confidence
   • Begin guiding others in a concerted effort

3. Bring Together Your Team
   • Do not make decisions in a vacuum!
   • Team should be multi-disciplinary
   • Subject Matter Experts
   • Remember that you cannot see and address all issues from every angle

5. Begin Recovery
   • Communicate Recovery Goals and Strategies
   • Re-Establish Critical Operations
   • Identify Temporary Locations for Doing Business
   • Determine Alternate Ways of Delivering Services and Products

2. Immediate Emergency Needs
   • Fire
   • Medical
   • Search and Rescue
   • Evacuation
   • Protection of Life and Property

4. What Resources Can Be Used to Recover?
   • Resources can be personnel, equipment, or possible data.
   • Mutual aid might be available from unaffected areas.
   • Private vendors offer a wide variety of disaster recovery services –including staff augmentation.

6. Bring Things Back to Normal
   • Continue communications
   • Document what can be improved upon
   • Make and improvement plan
   • Develop, strengthen, and improve upon disaster mitigation, preparedness, response and recovery plans
   • If needed, establish a “new normal”

Source: Rosenbauer Golden Hour
V. The Golden Hour – The Road to Recovery (Cont.)

Discussion - crisis management through Golden Hour

- How do you take care of immediate emergency needs?
- How do you bring together your team? Who are the stakeholders?
- How do you determine how bad you have been affected?
- How do you figure out what resources can be used for recovery?
- How do you determine your message and deliver it?
- How do you begin your recovery while response is occurring?
- How do you bring things back to normal or a “New Normal”?
VI. Data-driven Decision Making

Data is the lifeblood of decision-making and the raw material for accountability. Without high-quality data providing the right information on the right things at the right time; designing, monitoring and evaluating effective policies becomes almost impossible.¹ (IEAG, 2014)

Better data and statistics will help governments track progress and make sure their decisions are evidence-based; they can also strengthen accountability. A true data revolution would draw on existing and new sources of data to fully integrate statistics into decision making, promote open access to, and use of, data and ensure increased support for statistical systems.²

If properly mined and analyzed, Big Data can improve the understanding of human behavior and offer decision making support for global development in three main ways:

- Early Warning
- Real-time Awareness
- Real-time Feedback

VI. Data-driven Decision Making (Cont.)

DECISION-MAKING BASED ON DATA & SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE

For HEALTH EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

Source: Katia Valenza Lyons, Esri Suisse. UN Data Innovation Lab Data Visualization Tools And Techniques To Support Decision Making
## VII. Digital Government Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time horizon</th>
<th>Policy action</th>
<th>Digital Government Policy Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Short-term** | React | □ Use digital platforms (i.e., online portals, social media) for accurate and timely information-sharing  
□ Lead two-way communication with people and foster e-participation (i.e., hackathons, brainstorming events)  
□ Protect people’s privacy and sensitive data and take into consideration unintended consequences of technologies |
| **Mid-term** | Resolve | □ Form effective multi-stakeholder partnerships (i.e., private sector, international organizations, academia) on regional, national and local levels  
□ Leverage lessons learned and policy ideas from the ongoing crisis |
| **Long-term** | Reinvent | □ Invest in innovative technologies (i.e., AI, blockchain, robots, drones) to increase resilience of healthcare, the national economy and public services delivery  
□ Revisit data protection and privacy legislation along with lessons learned Invest in innovative technologies (i.e., AI, blockchain, robots, drones) to increase resilience of healthcare, the national economy and public services delivery |

Source: UN DESA
VII. Digital Government Tools (Cont.)

Building partnerships with private technology companies, social entrepreneurs or other national and international organizations

- can represent an effective way for governments to make use of existing technologies to meet the needs of people and soften the impact of the crisis on their lives
- can be crucial to maintain services for mission-critical communications and to ensure greater connectivity

Partnerships with the private sector in supporting governments have shown positive effects on the fight against the outbreak
VII. Digital Government Tools (Cont.)

Accelerating the implementation of innovative digital technologies
• need for government leadership in the development and adoption of new technologies
• AI-powered technology has proven to be beneficial
• 3D printing technologies have been adopted to produce replacement valves for reanimation devices, and protective medical face shields to address the shortage
• Robots and drones have been effective in providing security and sanitation
• Focus on improving data protection and digital inclusion policies

Innovative digital technologies for health emergency management
• Emergency broadcasting service (cellular broadcasting service)
• Smart Working
  □ A special website providing information of solution companies for remote working
  □ Smart working and social distancing (Holding virtual video conferences)
  □ Cyber Security Guidelines for Staff Working Remotely
• Remote Education: Providing educational contents by the central government
• Remote Medicare
  □ Remote medicine targeting confirmed coronavirus patients
  □ Telemedicine using apps (private sector)
• Predictive Research
• Creating apps

Digital technologies critical in facing COVID-19 Pandemic
• Make full use of digital technologies
• adopt an open government approach
• develop digital tools that can support people
• build multi-stakeholder partnerships
• seize the COVID-19 crisis as an opportunity to establish tailor-made digital government tools, strategies and collaborations for the future
VII. Digital Government Tools (Cont.)

Digital technology as a tool for pandemic preparedness and response

VII. Digital Government Tools (Cont.)

**Tracking**
- **Function**: Tracks disease activity in real time
- **Digital Technology**: Data dashboards; migration maps; machine learning; real-time data from smartphones and wearable technology
- **Advantages**: Allows visual depiction of spread; directs border restrictions; guides resource allocation; informs forecasts
- **Disadvantages**: Could breach privacy; involves high costs; requires management and regulation

**Screening for infection**
- **Function**: Screens individuals and populations for disease
- **Digital Technology**: Artificial intelligence; digital thermometers; mobile phone applications; thermal cameras; web-based toolkits
- **Advantages**: Provides information on disease prevalence and pathology; identifies individuals for testing, contact tracing, and isolation
- **Disadvantages**: Could breach privacy; fails to detect asymptomatic individuals if based on self-reported symptoms or monitoring of vital signs; involves high costs; requires management and regulation; requires validation of screening tools

**Contact tracing**
- **Function**: Identifies and tracks individuals who might have come into contact with an infected person
- **Digital Technology**: Global positioning systems; mobile phone applications; real-time monitoring of mobile devices; wearable technology
- **Advantages**: Identifies exposed individuals for testing and quarantine; tracks viral spread
- **Disadvantages**: Could breach privacy; might detect individuals who have not been exposed but have had contact; could fail to detect individuals who are exposed if the application is deactivated, the mobile device is absent, or Wi-Fi or cell connectivity is inadequate
VII. Digital Government Tools (Cont.)

Digital technology as a tool for pandemic preparedness and response

Quarantine and self-isolation
- **Function**: Identifies and tracks infected individuals, and implements quarantine
- **Digital Technology**: Artificial intelligence; cameras and digital recorders; global positioning systems; mobile phone applications; quick response codes
- **Advantages**: Isolates infections; restricts travel
- **Disadvantages**: Violates civil liberties; could restrict access to food and essential services; fails to detect individuals who leave quarantine without devices

Clinical management
- **Function**: Diagnoses infected individuals; monitors clinical status; predicts clinical outcomes; provides capacity for telemedicine services and virtual care
- **Digital Technology**: Artificial intelligence for diagnostics; machine learning; virtual care or telemedicine platforms
- **Advantages**: Assists with clinical decision-making, diagnostics, and risk prediction; enables efficient service delivery; facilitates patient-centred, remote care; facilitates infection control
- **Disadvantages**: Could breach privacy; fails to accurately diagnose patients; involves high costs; equipment may malfunction
VIII. Managing Health Emergency at the Subnational level

**Short-term measures:** managing the emergency and the public health crisis

- Taking emergency measures to face the health crisis
- Activating vertical and horizontal multi-level coordination mechanisms for crisis management
- Adapting subnational public services to containment
- Adapting sub-national government public finance
- Adapting sub-national government organization

**Medium-term policy implications:** managing the economic, social and public finance crisis

- Coping with the economic and social crisis at territorial level
- Coping with the subnational public finance crisis
- Reviewing sub-national government administrative and operational organization for the delivery of public services
- Reviewing multi-level coordination mechanisms for crisis management

**Longer term challenges:** seizing opportunities for more resilient society

- Reviewing and enhancing multi-level governance practices
- Ensuring affordable and accessible quality basic services, including health, for all territories and people
- Establishing new regional/local development models, and rebalancing urban/rural areas
- Establishing new regional/local development models, and rebalancing urban/rural areas
- Supporting the transition to a low carbon economy
### VIII. Managing Health Emergency at the subnational level (Cont.)

#### Considerations in planning for local preparedness for health emergency

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>Adopt a coordinated multisectoral, whole-of-government and whole-of-society approach</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>Promote coordination and coherence in measures across different levels of governance</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>Identify existing hazards and vulnerabilities</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>Identify and equitably protect vulnerable subpopulations</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><strong>Consider the diverse social and cultural interactions with health issues, norms and perceptions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><strong>Consider the extent of reliance on the informal sector or economy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td><strong>Consider the most appropriate means of communication of information</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td><strong>Ensure continued provision of essential services</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td><strong>Ensure that existing health facilities are prepared for health emergencies</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td><strong>Ensure adequate housing, reduce the risk of becoming homeless and anticipate outward-migration &amp; mobility</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td><strong>Ensuring that due consideration is given to maintaining good mental wellbeing</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td><strong>Ensure preparedness measures are rooted in a robust evidence-base</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VIII. Managing Health Emergency at the subnational level (Cont.)

**Key areas of focus for local preparedness for an effective response to health emergency such as COVID-19**

1. Coordinated local plans in preparation for effective responses to health risks and impacts
2. Risk and crisis communication and community engagement that encourage compliance with measures
3. Contextually appropriate approaches to public health measures, especially physical distancing, hand hygiene and respiratory etiquette
4. Access to healthcare services for COVID-19 and the continuation of essential services

**Preparing for future emergencies**

1. Urgent actions taken by local governments for COVID-19 must set the stage for sustainable capacity development for concurrent or future health emergencies
2. Local government should also document, learn, share and adapt during their COVID-19 experience, including taking proactive steps to collect evidence and advocate for the financing of sustainable capacities

**Key lessons for the COVID-19 response at the sub-national level**

1. Eliminate institutional overlaps
2. Encourage emergency preparedness
3. Enhance integration
4. Empower citizens
5. Everyday resilience

Training Toolkit on Effective National to Local Public Governance for SDG Implementation
Supporting Vulnerable Groups

- Health crisis affects some population groups more than others both in the short- and long-term
- Households without health insurance are also particularly vulnerable
- The governance should support the vulnerable and support the economic situation by mobilizing public finance as well as supporting the basic needs
- Local and regional governments have large competencies in the social services sector
- Areas that have been particularly hit may need additional support from national governments to successfully implement necessary actions
- Ensure that government and other stakeholders prioritize the information and communication needs of children and adolescents
- Ensure active outreach to collect feedback from persons with disabilities
- Involve organizations of persons with disabilities in consultation and decision making
- Ensure that community engagement teams are gender balanced and promote women’s leadership within these
- Translate the materials/information into local languages and adapt to local context.
- Disseminate this information through efficient channels including NGOs, refugee or migrant volunteers and respective communities
- Engage the elderly to address their specific feedback
VIII. Managing Health Emergency at the subnational level (Cont.)

Financial Resources

- Adequate financial allocations are required
- Health emergency management has a recurrent cost which should be fully considered
- Financial mechanisms should also include contingency funding for response and recovery
- National budgetary systems need to be sufficiently flexible
- Financial arrangements for emergency care

- Social/health safety nets
- Compensation systems
- Cash transfer mechanisms
- Resource mobilization

Government Financial Assistance Measures

Country Cases
- China, Finland, Italy, Singapore, Uzbekistan
### IX. Key Takeaways

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Develop a national strategy</th>
<th>Equip departments and agencies with the capacity to anticipate and manage human induce threats</th>
<th>Continuously share knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assign leadership at the national level</td>
<td>Monitor and strengthen core risk management capacities</td>
<td>Enhance government capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engage all government actors at national and sub-national levels</td>
<td>Plan for contingent liabilities within clear public finance frameworks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establish multi-stakeholder partnerships</td>
<td>Establish strategic crisis management capacities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourage a whole-of-society approach</td>
<td>Strengthen crisis leadership, early detection and sense making capacity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen the mix of structural protection</td>
<td>Establish the competence and capacities to scale up emergency response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourage businesses to take steps</td>
<td>Build institutional capacity to design and oversee recovery and reconstruction plans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop risk anticipation capacity</td>
<td>Transparency, accountability and integrity of the public sector are of the utmost importance for preventing corruption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
References

References


References


