Training Toolkit on Effective National to Local Public Governance for SDG Implementation
Consultation Process for Policy Formulation

Module 3.3
Learning Outcomes

- Understand the concept, guidance, and process of consultation
- Learn to engage a multi-level dialogue with lower, upper levels of government and other stakeholders to localize the SDGs
- Learn to ensure the inclusiveness and accountability of the consultations
- Make use of different tools for consultation
- Understanding how to tailor-make stakeholder engagement processes for vulnerable groups
Elements need to be in place to galvanize popular support around the 2030 Agenda and the SDGs

- Making the SDGs known
- Gender balance, youth participation and leaving no one behind
- Generating the means to implement effective participation
- Creating an enabling environment for participation
- Promoting a data revolution
- Connecting interconnected agendas
II. Guidance on Consultation Process

- **Two core process principles as a foundation for the consultation guidelines**
  - **Inclusion**
    - Particular focus on effectively involving those who are commonly underrepresented or marginalized in decision-making processes
  - **Accountability**
    - Ensure that people who participate in the consultations have access to relevant information and can provide feedback and influence the results and the process of the consultations
II. Guidance on Consultation Process (Cont.)

Suggestions to help ensure the inclusiveness and accountability of the consultations

- Whom to engage?
- How to engage?
- Which method should be used?
- The role of the facilitator
- Logistics
II. Guidance on Consultation Process (Cont.)

Identifying stakeholders

- stakeholders, whereby individuals are represented by organizations, including NGOs, community-based organizations (CBOs), universities and research institutions, private sector entities, interest groups
- experts on particular issues
- semi-governmental actors such as a national human rights institution or ombudsman
- political decision makers, including government authorities, and parliamentarians
- private sector entities, including small businesses and local entrepreneurs

Considerations for selecting stakeholders

- Start by mapping relevant stakeholder groups
- Understand the difference between groups
- Ensure that the diversity of civil society is taken into account
- Use a clear and transparent selection process
- Ensure a balanced and representative mix of stakeholder groups
- Invite actors who would not otherwise have a seat at the table
- When appropriate, identify and work with established civil society networks and platforms
- When appropriate, identify and work with institutions for tripartite social dialogue
- Ensure that membership-based organizations representing massive numbers of citizens
II. Guidance on Consultation Process (Cont.)

How to engage? Preparing an inclusive consultation

a. Questions to ensure inclusiveness and accountability when planning

**Inclusiveness**

- Are there any constraints that may block the participation of certain groups of stakeholders?
- Are there differences between various stakeholders’ decision-making processes?
- How can we ensure that communication tools or channels are tailored to stakeholder groups’ values, norms and languages? What culturally appropriate consultation mechanisms can be established through the creation of consultative groups, or through consultations at the local level?

**Accountability**

- How do we draw on existing dialogue institutions or forums that function?
- How do we disseminate the information about the consultations well in advance, so that stakeholders have sufficient time to engage in the process?
- How do we ensure that stakeholders who have committed time and effort to the consultations can be informed about the results of the consultations?
- How do we ensure that stakeholders have a chance to raise suggestions or concerns regarding the process?
- How do we ensure that all documents and final reports are shared among stakeholders at the end of the process?
II. Guidance on Consultation Process (Cont.)

How to engage? Preparing an inclusive consultation

b. Format (or ‘shape’) of the consultation process

- Participation of different stakeholders at different levels (e.g., surveys, town hall meetings)
- Consolidation (e.g., by a smaller multi-stakeholder team)
- Validation (e.g., online consultation on results, focus groups, face-to-face meetings)

Training Toolkit on Effective National to Local Public Governance for SDG Implementation

Module 3.3: Consultation Process for Policy Formulation
II. Guidance on Consultation Process (Cont.)

Which method should be used?

- **Topic**: The nature and scope of the issues to be discussed
- **Objectives**: Reasons for involvement and expected outcomes
- **Time**: Amount of time available
- **Budget**: Availability of resources
- **Participants**: Who will be engaged in the consultations

The role of the facilitator

- Operate **transparently**
- Communicate clearly
- Operate with **integrity**
- **Respect** different perspectives
- Constructively **address conflicting positions** and power imbalances within the discussion groups
- **Facilitate the sharing** of different perspectives
- Be **accountable**
- Ensure the process adapts to local needs
- Evaluate the consultation approach

Logistics: Preparing a consultation

**Preparation**
- Ensure the objective and the expected results from the consultation are clear
- Establish a workflow for pre-consultation communication with attendees
- Inform attendees of consultation agenda and other background materials

**Venue of meeting**
- Accessible

**Post-consultation**
- **Survey**
- Establish a feedback loop mechanism
III. Local and Regional Government Involvement

- Promote policy coherence for sustainable development
- Promote synergies among national, regional and local policies
- Engage a multi-level dialogue with all levels of government

Involve local and regional governments to align priorities and ensure coordinated action and consistency across all levels of government for sustainable development.
III. Local and Regional Government Involvement

Estonia

Representatives of local governments are included in the Estonian Sustainable Development Commission, formed in 1996.

Japan

The national government encourages local governments to incorporate the SDGs into their strategies and policies. The Headquarters sets “vitalizing local areas through promoting the SDGs” as one of the three basic directions of Japan’s SDG Model in the SDGs Action Plan 2018. The Headquarters plans to create a project “SDGs Models of Local Governments” through which the entire central government will provide extensive support to selected local governments in their SDGs implementation, and then expand to other local governments based on lessons learnt.

Denmark

Each year the government negotiates the following year’s budget for municipalities and regions. The government and municipalities and regions agree to co-operate to achieve the SDGs and integrate sustainable development in policy making.
Public consultation is a formal process through which citizens and stakeholders give their feedback and views on policies, plans, proposals, laws and other options presented by the government.

Inclusive, regular and meaningful consultation between national governments and stakeholders – including civil society – is essential for SDG implementation, accountability and transparency.

- Consultations are well designed, properly resourced, and based on a genuine desire
- Able to influence the government’s proposal, plan, policy or report on the SDGs
- Seek to reach a range of different relevant stakeholders
- Steps should be taken to ensure that existing power relations
- Outcome of consultations should be shared widely
- Require a change in culture in how governments interact and cooperate with the public
IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

How can it be used?

- Urge the government to hold public consultations regularly
- Ensure consultations are inclusive and engage vulnerable and marginalized groups
- Publicize the outcome of consultations
- Determine whether there is an existing consultation mechanism
- Raise awareness of consultations
- Promote transparency and make information publicly available during and after consultations
IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

- Informal consultation
- Public hearings
- Circulation of regulatory proposals for public comment
- Advisory bodies
- Public notice-and-comment

Tools for Consultation
Use of information and communication technology, online public consultations

Provide decision-makers with the means to communicate directly with citizens in real time

Engage with and ask questions of decision-makers, provide feedback on government services and comment on the policies and decisions of governments

Use as a two-way street to promote accountability for the SDGs

Digital tools should ideally be used in combination with other methods for public consultation
IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

Example: Participation and the budget process

**Public participation in fiscal policy**

Participation may be invited by an official entity

Participation, together with transparency, is a key pillar of accountability

Complementary to existing institutional mechanisms and accountability systems in the budget process

**Public institutions have to make clear what they expect from citizen engagement**

Face-to-face communication, deliberation or input to decision-making

It ranges from one-off public consultations or invitations for submissions, to on-going and institutionalized relationships

Participation can be through broad-based public engagement as well as deliberations involving experts, or combinations of the two
IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

Mechanisms for public engagement at different stages of the budget cycle

- **Audit and oversight**
  - SAI engagement on audit planning, and conduct of performance audits (budget monitor)
  - Legislative consultation on departmental reviews
  - Social audits of revenues and expenditures

- **Executive Budget Preparation**
  - Pre-budget hearings / consultations / submissions
  - Public Councils
  - Tax policy reviews and consultations
  - Bottom-Up consultations
  - Online mechanisms

- **Budget Implementation**
  - Consultation on Policy Statement & annual proposal
  - Public hearings + Submissions on money Bills
  - Independent Fiscal Institutions

- **Legislative approval**
  - SAI: Supreme Audit Institution

IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

Fiscal information and other relevant data should be disseminated.

Governments should be responsive regarding the purpose, scope, intended outcomes, process and timelines, as well as the expected and actual results of public participation.

Governments should make distinct efforts to reach out to the most marginalized groups.

Information and communication technologies (ICT) offer new opportunities for public participation in budgeting.

Requisites and enablers for public participation in budget matters.
Transparency in the local budgeting process – example of Republic of Korea

Source: http://lofin.mois.go.kr/
Transparency in the local budgeting process – example of Republic of Korea

Local Public Finance Statistics
Providing an integrated disclosure, information on revenue and expenditure, contract, current public facilities, etc.

Open Local Public Finance Data
Providing Open API, Sheet, etc. related to the local public finance to the general public

Local Public Finance at a Glance
Providing visual information on various topics and issues in which people might have interest

Source: http://lofin.mois.go.kr/
# Transparency in the local budgeting process – example of Republic of Korea

## Information Types and Disclosure Period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Information</th>
<th>Contents of Information</th>
<th>Timeframe</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local Finance at a Glance</td>
<td>Visualization by Themes Learning public finance Public finance terminology dictionary</td>
<td>Anytime</td>
<td>Status of Budget, Financial Condition, Fiscal Soundness, Efficiency of Financial Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Finance OpenData</td>
<td>Dataset, Public Open Data</td>
<td>Anytime</td>
<td>Budget of Tax Revenue and Expenditures, Schedule of Mid-term Fiscal Planning, Integrated Local Finance Statistics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [http://lofin.mois.go.kr/](http://lofin.mois.go.kr/)
Funding for SDGs and local participation – example of Australia

**Australia – Fund My Community Initiative** - a grant programme that used digital participatory budgeting to allocate AUD 1 million annually to improve the lives of disadvantaged, isolated or vulnerable South Australians.

- Citizens are engaged in prioritization of the proposals for project funding

- Key success factors:
  - **Accessibility of relevant information and visible changes**
  - **Involving multiple stakeholders in design and implementation**
Participatory budgeting (PB) is a process where non-elected citizens decide on how to spend a part of the public budget. It is a process that is guided by several principles (Sintomer et al 2012):

- It is concerned with financial question – “how to spend limited budget”
- Engagement is at the level of city or a decentralized district – should be a power over resources
- Must be a repeated (over the years) process - one time event is not counted as PB
- Should be a deliberative process (in a form of meetings or forums)
- Accountability is required, e.g. results of the deliberations are made known

First well recognized participatory budgeting – Porto Alegre, Brazil, 1989

PB Links with SDG: Ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels Target 16.7
IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

Participatory Budgeting in Pune, India

- PMC – Pune Municipal Corporation
- Prabhag Samiti – smallest unit of the electoral ward

Categories where citizens can suggest work:
- Footpaths/ cycle tracks
- Road
- Street lights
- Traffic signals
- Bus stops
- Public parking
- Public toilets
- Solid waste management
- Water (supply)
- Storm water
- Gardens
- Public buildings
- Signage
- Others

Source: Naim Keruwala Ar. Komal Potdar Maya Roy – Janwani

Training Toolkit on Effective National to Local Public Governance for SDG Implementation
IV. Public Consultation (Cont.)

Framework to Assess the Public Budgeting Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators related to the Nature and Scope of the Process</th>
<th>Quantitative Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Participation is about use of a limited budget</td>
<td>• Proportion of population in the city aware about the process and can participate easily if they wish to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• It is repeated over the years</td>
<td>• Numbers of people participating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There is political acceptance about the process</td>
<td>• Numbers of projects being submitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The process is proactive and invites/ facilitates participation</td>
<td>• Numbers of projects getting included in the budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Disadvantaged persons are able to easily participate</td>
<td>• Proportion of the total discretionary budget (that is non-establishment related, meant for projects, capital expenditure, O and M etc) available for citizens input</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Adequate information is available to citizens at various stages of the PB process, such as when the process gets underway, information about the wards including maps, lists of projects already underway, and what is already being planned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Public deliberation is part of the process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Public deliberations are easily accessible, fair and facilitate public decision-making on the budget or at least the priorities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The results at various stages of the process are known/ transparent (what has been submitted; what’s being taken on board; reasons why suggestions are accepted or not accepted).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Projects suggested and agreed upon in public deliberations are actually included in the city’s budget</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From Menon et al. 2013
V. Protection and Promotion of Civic Space

“We the peoples of the United Nations determined to save succeeding generations from the scourge of war […], to reaffirm faith in fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person, in the equal rights of men and women and of nations large and small, to establish conditions under which justice and respect for the obligations arising from treaties and other sources of international law can be maintained, and to promote social progress and better standards of life in larger freedom.”

– Preamble, Charter of the United Nations

Open Civic Space

Freedom of expression, association, assembly

Right to participate

Security of those who speak up

Results

• Variety of Voices
• Options tailored to need
• Candid feedback

• Better responses
• Stronger buy-ins

• More Sustainable Peace
• Better Development Outcomes
• More Resilient Societies

Adopted from UN Guidance Note on Protection and Promotion of Civic Space
Module 3.3: Consultation Process for Policy Formulation

V. Protection and Promotion of Civic Space

3 Ps of civic space

Protection
Participation
Promotion

Adopted from UN Guidance Note on Protection and Promotion of Civic Space
VI. Key Takeaways

1. The success of our collective journey to 2030 will **greatly depend on how effectively Governments engage other stakeholders**

2. **Engaging appropriately the sub-national levels of government** promotes coordinated actions and enhance coherence across levels of governments for sustainable development

3. Public consultation should also involve **regular dialogue between decision-makers, citizens and other stakeholders on progress, challenges, gaps and next steps in implementing, monitoring and reviewing the SDGs.**

4. While consultations may vary depending upon the national or cultural context, there are a number of **essential conditions for a good consultation**

5. **Digital tools should ideally be used** in combination with other methods for public consultation

6. **Participation, together with transparency,** is a key pillar of accountability, in general as well as in relation to the budget process
Are there any mechanisms in place to enable the involvement of local and regional governments in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of national plans or strategies for sustainable development (SDGs)?

Are there mechanisms to ensure effective feedback between different levels of government regarding the integration of sustainable development into laws and regulations?

Are there mechanisms or incentives that foster policy alignment, complementarities and cooperation between central and subnational governments?

Are there any mechanisms in place to ensure coherent and coordinated action of agencies from different government levels involved in international initiatives/development co-operation?
References


• The road to dignity by 2030: ending poverty, transforming all lives and protecting the planet. Synthesis report of the Secretary-General on the post-2015 Agenda. A/69/700. 4 December 2014


Thank you
### 1. Whom To Engage?

- National Government
- Subnational Governments
- Local Authorities
- CIVIL SOCIETY
- Private Sector
- Employers’ Organizations
- Business Associations Domestic Firms
- Export Industries
- Trade Unions
- Public Sector
- Scientific & Technical Community
- Academia
- Individual Experts
- Think Tanks & Research Centers
- Bilateral & Multilateral Donors, Foundations

- Aging & elderly population
- Community based groups (CBOs)
- Indigenous communities
- Informal sector workers
- LGBT community NGOs
- Persons with disabilities
- People with physical disabilities
- People with mental disabilities
- People with learning or intellectual disabilities
- Faith-based groups
- Women’s groups
- Youth groups & children
Annexes

**2. Key Considerations For Engaging Stakeholders**

- Understand relevant historic context of country or community
- Can share cultural practices & beliefs
- Level of technical capacity
- Ensure materials are understandable for laypeople and do not include technical jargon
- Provide translations into languages that people are most comfortable expressing themselves in
- Encourage respectful atmosphere
- Ensure people feel comfortable wearing their preferred clothes
- Ensure that interaction and language does not reinforce stereotypes or discrimination
- Communication barriers
- Literacy level of attendees
- Need for raised-print or large print materials
- Use of graphics and visual aids as descriptions

**3. Leveraging & Building Partnerships Outsourcing The Process**

- Academia
- Civil society organizations (CSOs)
- Donor Community
- Bilateral agencies
- Multilateral agencies
- Government institutions
- NGOs
- Private consultants
- Public-private partnerships
### 4. How To Engage? Formats Of Consultations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-Consultation</th>
<th>During Consultation</th>
<th>Post Consultation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Thorough registration</td>
<td>Follow-up surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail-out</td>
<td>Survey of relevant demographic information</td>
<td>Gather responses from web platforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement in local newspapers &amp; radio</td>
<td>May need to provide assistance for language or literacy barriers in filling out surveys</td>
<td>Thorough documentation of methodologies utilized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stations</td>
<td>Focus group</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-on-one Interview</td>
<td>Citizen panel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online survey</td>
<td>Citizen jury</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Survey Monkey</td>
<td>Citizen planning cell</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mind Mixer</td>
<td>Parallel conference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crowdbrite</td>
<td>Consensus conference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media</td>
<td>Technology &amp; e-consulting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion boards</td>
<td>Webinar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blogs</td>
<td>Live streaming</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisements</td>
<td>Social media</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 5. Organizational Issues & Logistics

- Choose formats and timing that consider people’s means as well as livelihood, family, religious or other key exigencies
- Accessible location
- Know attendees’ transportation options
- Proximity to public transportation
- Will childcare or daycare service be factored into participant’s costs?
- Are there existing, local meeting platforms that could be utilized?
- Venue constructed with universal design features
- Automatic doors

- Access ramps to entrance, meeting room, and bathrooms
- Elevators
- Accessible toilet
- Meeting Room
- Accommodates accessible technology
- Audio-visual aids
- Displays with captions
- Live captioning or dictation software
- Seating arrangement allows for wheelchair access
- The room is quiet and encourages contemplative, peaceful discussion
Annexes

6. Facilitation Of The Consultation Process

- Registration system
- Should develop a database to record the participants and the demographics (voluntary reporting by participants)
- Gather most up-to-date means of communicating with attendees
- Establish a timeline for when communications will be released and how feedback will be gathered
- Recruit a facilitator
- Highly important for small meetings such as focus groups, interviews, or citizen planning cells
- Communicates clearly
- Strong contextual knowledge vis-à-vis attendees present

- Native or highly advanced working knowledge of language of those present
- Awareness of social cues which indicate levels of understanding, agreement or disagreement
- Does not have relationships with attendees that may affect open expression of opinions
- Encourages an atmosphere of openness knowledge-sharing
- Good at asking probing questions
- Able to handle difficult attendees
- Training of a less-experienced facilitator may be necessary to meet unique knowledge requirements
### 7. Documenting The Consultation Process

- Identify and recruit rapporteurs
- Take precise and accurate notes
- Have strong knowledge of languages spoken and nuances of word choice
- Note social cues
- Person to record, videotape or photography proceedings

- Keep all attendees informed of and get their approval to being recorded
- Document participation to ensure transparency but without jeopardizing people’s safety or dignity
- Good to have both an observer, noting qualitative information, and a rapporteur documenting dialogue and language used
- Evaluate performance of facilitator and accuracy of rapporteurs