



# Peer-to-Peer Learning International Workshop on One-Door-Service Centers (ODSCs) Back-to-back with the National Workshop on Implementing the ODSCs in Lao People's Democratic Republic (Lao PDR)

Organized by

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA), through the Division for Public Institutions and Digital Government (DPIDG) and its project office United Nations Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), and in collaboration with the Resident Coordinators Office (RCO) in Lao PDR and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

# **Outcome Report**

## Wednesday, 4 August 2021

08:30 am – 13:15 pm and 14:15 pm – 16:00 pm | Lao Time 10:30 am – 15:15 pm and 16:15 pm – 18:00 pm | Korea Standard Time 21:30 pm (3 August 2021) – 02:15 am, and 03:15 am – 05:00 am | Eastern Standard Time

# Held via Zoom and on the premises of the Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA), Vientiane

# **United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs**

The Department of Economic and Social Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat is a vital interface between global policies in the economic, social, and environmental spheres and national action. The department works in three main interlinked areas: (i) it compiles, generates, and analyses a wide range of economic, social, and environmental data and information on which States Members of the United Nations draw to review common problems and to take stock of policy options; (ii) it facilitates the negotiations of Member States in many intergovernmental bodies on a joint course of action to address ongoing or emerging global challenges; and (iii) it advises interested Governments on the ways and means of translating policy frameworks developed in United Nations conferences and summits into programmes at the country level and, through technical assistance, helps build national capacities.

### Disclaimers

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The views expressed are those of the individual authors and do not imply any expression of opinion on the part of the United Nations.

Copyright © United Nations, 2021

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without prior permission. Websites: publicadministration.un.org and unpan.un.org

## Acknowledgments

This report captures the proceedings from the workshop on "Peer-to-Peer Learning International Workshop on One-Door-Service Centers (ODSCs)," organized by the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA), through its Division for Public Institutions and Digital Government (DPIDG) and with the support of its project office on governance (UNPOG), and in collaboration with the Resident Coordinators Office in Lao PDR and UNDP Lao Office. We are grateful to H.E. Mr. Thongchan Manixay, Minister of Home Affairs, Lao PDR, and his team from MOHA and the Department of Local Administration (DOLA) for the invaluable time and contribution to the workshop.

The international and regional workshops on ODSC were supported by UN DESA's Development Account Project 1819G on "Institutional arrangements for policy integration, coordination, and stakeholder engagement in SDG implementation and reviews in Asia & the Pacific."

Under the responsibility of Juwang Zhu, Director of DPIDG, the UN DESA team was led by Adriana Alberti, Chief, Programme Management and Capacity Development Unit, Bokyun Shim, Head of UNPOG, and Jonas Rabinovitch, Senior Advisor on Innovation and Public Service Delivery with the support of Keping Yao, Prabin Maharjan, Samuel Danaa, Hye Yong Kim, Markus Johannes Zock, Hye Kyung Choi (Shelley), Wooyoung Kim, Gregory Mark McGann, and Huiwen Tan. Likewise, we are indebted to Ricarda Rieger, Resident Coordinator a.i., United Nations Office in Lao PDR and Sean O'Connell, Head of Governance, UNDP Lao PDR, for their excellent collaboration in organizing the workshop.

Sanva Saephan and Souvannadara Souvannasane (Nou Nou), both UN DESA consultants, provided support in preparing the workshop and acted as facilitators. Aslam Alam, Chairman, and Executive Director, Bangladesh Institute for Information Literacy and Sustainable Development, and UN DESA consultant, also contributed to the organization of the event, conducted research, and made a presentation on the building blocks for effective ODSCs, highlighting international experiences and a checklist for the effective implementation of ODSCs.

This report benefited from presentations, fruitful discussions, comments, and information provided by the workshop panelists from Azerbaijan, Bangladesh, Republic of Korea, Singapore, Vietnam, and UNDP Regional Innovation Center in Bangkok Regional Hub, listed in the Agenda. We are also grateful to all our interns for their support during the workshop.

# **Table of Contents**

1. Overview of the Training Workshop	5
1.1 Event Description	5
1.2 Objectives	5
1.3 Thematic Focus	5
1.4 Outcomes	7
1.5 Participants' Feedback	7
2. Key Messages	9
3. Key Learnings	
4. Next Steps	
5. Minutes - Peer-To-Peer Learning International Workshop On ODSCs	
5.1 Opening	
5.2 Overview Presentation on ODSCs	
5.3 Overview Presentation on International Experiences of ODSCs	
5.4 Session 1: Critical Role of Leadership for Effective ODSCs	
5.5 Session 2: Institutional Coordination	
5.6 Session 3: Structural Organization, Processes, Digitization, and Financin ODSCs	0
5.7 Session 4: Effective National to Local Governance	
5.8 Session 5: Monitoring, Reporting, and Evaluation	
5.9 Lessons Learned from the Implementation of OSS for Service Delivery	
5.10 Closing Remarks	
6. National Workshop on Lessons Learned and Next Steps in Implementing the in Lao PDR	
6.1 Opening	
6.2 Debriefing about the International Presentations and Discussions during	
Morning Segment	
6.3 Presentations of Checklist for Effective ODSCs	
6.4 Overview Presentation of the Digital Government Capability Assessment	58
6.5 Highlights of Digital Government Transformation in Lao	
6.6 Presentations by ODSCs - Challenges, lessons learned, and way forward.	
6.7 Presentation on ODSC Roadmap	
6.8 Closing	
7. Annex	61
7.1 Evaluation Survey Results	61
7.2 Agenda of the Workshops	

#### 1. Overview of the Training Workshop

#### **1.1 Event Description**

UN DESA, through DPIDG and with the support of UNPOG, and in collaboration with the Resident Coordinators Office in Lao PDR and UNDP, organized a peer-to-peer learning international workshop on ODSCs back-to-back with a national workshop on lessons learned and next steps in implementing the ODSCs Lao PDR. The international and regional workshops on ODSCs were supported by UN DESA's Development Account Project 1819G on "Institutional arrangements for policy integration, coordination, and stakeholder engagement in SDG implementation and reviews in Asia & the Pacific."

#### **1.2 Objectives**

The Peer-to-Peer Learning Workshop was a follow-up to UN DESA's webinar organized on 6 April 2021, in cooperation with UNDP in Lao. MOHA of Lao PDR and the representatives of all 44 ODSCs attended the webinar.

The objective was to discuss some of the success factors and challenges confronting ODSCs and their priority development plans. The ODSCs emphasized that their priority development plan is to strengthen the provision of public service delivery. Many ODSCs expressed interest in learning from other ODSCs how to enhance their capacities and embrace digital technologies in ODSCs operations. The National Workshop on ODSCs in Lao aimed to discuss lessons learned from the international peer-to-peer learning workshop and the next steps in implementing the ODCSs.

The ultimate goal of the workshops was to strengthen government capacity for the design and implementation of sustainable ODSCs for public services in Lao PDR. The workshops provided a platform for decision-makers and ODSC officials of Lao PDR to learn lessons on promoting effective, inclusive, and accountable ODSCs to mitigate current and future challenges in public service delivery. The invited panelists shared knowledge about various mechanisms to modernize ODSCs (usually referred to as "One-Stop-Shops" or OSS) to achieve higher citizen satisfaction while implementing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

#### **1.3 Thematic Focus**

Due to the proliferation of ODSCs/One-Stop-Shops<sup>1</sup> around the globe, there are many examples to learn from. Peer-to-peer learning among countries is an effective way to take stock of one's own situation, adapt or modify an existing approach that can be useful for a country's context and local conditions while fostering innovative solutions to the extent possible.

The purpose of ODSCs is to create a streamlined and easy-to-use interface between government and citizens, offering a number of services in one location. ODSCs can reduce unnecessary paperwork, as well as citizens' time and effort in accessing services. ODSCs can be a very effective way to communicate regulatory requirements more clearly to citizens. When implemented effectively, ODSCs can provide "win-win" outcomes for governments and citizens by improving both service delivery and compliance with regulations. Citizens can more

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The terms 'One-Door-Service Centers (ODSC) and 'One-Stop-Shops (OSSs)' are used interchangeably in this report.

easily locate forms, supply information once for multiple purposes, and do business more efficiently. Governments can receive better quality information and improved compliance rates that reduce the number of resources needed for enforcement.

There is no universal One-Stop-Shop model for all circumstances. They are extremely diverse. For instance, they can operate in seemingly discrete policy areas or geographical locations; and at the same time, there are One-Stop-Shops with more than 10,000 staff responsible for delivering a whole suite of government services.<sup>2</sup> There are other differences in terms of scope, purpose, and communication tools used by various One-Stop Shops. The design, operation, and improvement of these vastly different models pose several unique challenges for governments and users. Furthermore, public institutions face increasing pressure to deliver comprehensive, complex services efficiently, effectively, equitably, and through integrated service delivery models to enhance the citizen experience. Delivering tailored, citizen-focused services requires transformative innovation at all levels of the organization to empower public servants and citizens within individual agencies and across public institutions.

Citizen-centric services cannot be created and sustained without government transformation. In addition, governments need to communicate in ways that respond to the needs of their citizens and businesses. However, designing and implementing ODSCs requires upfront and ongoing investment and a change in public servants' mindset about the need to focus on citizens' needs and results. In more advanced stages of ODSCs development, government readiness to leverage technologies is also necessary to deliver integrated services.

Experts and citizens agree that the application of digital government to the challenges of public administration and effective service delivery has been one of the most powerful and transformative governance trends throughout the developing world.<sup>3</sup> Digital government is used to streamline and re-engineer public service delivery processes and create ODSCs to facilitate improved service delivery. The most significant developments in the design and functioning of ODSCs are linked to digital transformation. The availability and spread of new digital technologies are opening new channels for governments to provide information and services to their citizens, expanding the possibilities for service access and interactions. These include online solutions and digital platforms, facilitating data exchange between government entities and citizens, and creating national ID systems as unique identifiers that can be used to catalog services, documents and target citizens for specific services. Also, digital technologies can be used for citizen engagement and outreach, for instance, using a proactive social media strategy such as video-chat, exit surveys, and complaint books and hotlines.

At the macro level, there are key structural building blocks to be considered when strengthening One-Stop Shop's effectiveness, including:

- 1. Political commitment
- 2. Transformational leadership, human resources, and changing mindsets
- 3. Institutional coordination and system thinking
- 4. Coherence between national and local/regional level
- 5. Organizational structures and processes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/b0b0924e-en/1/2/1/index.html?itemId=/content/publication/b0b0924e-en&\_csp\_=8b1c0b4372e0acf52e4f0b9a687601df&itemIGO=oecd&itemContentType=book

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Karippacheril, Tina George, Soonhee Kim, Robert P. Beschel Jr., and Changyong Choi, editors. 2016. *Bringing Government into the 21st Century: The Korean Digital Governance Experience*. Directions in Development. Washington, DC: World Bank. doi:10.1596/978-1-4648-0881-4. License: Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 3.0 IGO

- 6. Financing
- 7. Digital Technology and Data Management
- 8. Stakeholders' engagement
- 9. Monitoring, reporting, and evaluation (including mechanisms for citizen feedback).

At the operational level, the key steps to be considered when improving one-stop-shops are:

- 1. Mapping the key stakeholders to be involved
- 2. Visioning and action planning process
- 3. Institutional readiness assessment
- 4. Setting a strategy and identifying goals and targets
- 5. Identifying actions and their owners and supporters and required actions for operationalization
- 6. Enumerating financial and non-financial resources
- 7. Road map for implementation
- 8. Monitoring and evaluation

#### **1.4 Outcomes**

#### International Peer-to-Peer Learning Workshop

The peer-to-peer learning workshop helped to:

- Uncover common challenges and roadblocks to the implementation of their respective OSS/ODSCs.
- Enhance awareness of the various approaches and methodologies adopted by different countries to overcome some of the challenges in the implementation of ODSCs.
- Identify the key building blocks in reforming Lao's ODSCs.
- Establish follow-up mechanisms for further peer-to-peer learning.

#### National Workshop on ODSCs for Public Service Delivery in Lao

The National Workshop on ODCS, which followed the regional Workshop, helped to:

- Enhance ODCSs knowledge of the building blocks needed for effective implementation of the ODCS and how they apply to their national circumstances.
- Enhance their understanding of the need for national to local coordination and for horizontal coordination.
- Increase their awareness of the capacities needed for effective ODCSs.
- Established follow-up actions.

#### **1.5 Participants' Feedback**

The workshop was attended by officials from 44 ODSCs, MOHA, and DOLA teams. Thirtytwo (32) evaluation responses from the representative of different ODSCs were collected following the workshop.

Participants strongly agreed or agreed that the training:

- Enhanced their understanding of common challenges and roadblocks to the implementation of their respective OSS/ODSCs (over 87%).
- Enhanced their awareness of the various approaches and methodologies adopted by different countries to overcome some of the challenges in the implementation of ODSCs (96%).
- Helped to identify the key building blocks in reforming their ODSCs (over 87%).
- Established plans for follow-up mechanisms for further peer-to-peer learning (over 87%).
- Enhanced their knowledge of the building blocks needed for effective implementation of the ODCS and how they apply to their national circumstances (over 87%).
- Enhanced the need for national to local coordination and for horizontal coordination (100%).
- Increased the awareness of the capacities needed for effective ODCSs (over 84%).

Overall, participants provided "excellent" and "very good" feedback (on average above 75%) in terms of information and support provided; quality of resource material, overall quality of facilitation/delivery of sessions, conversations with the panelists, and overall workshop design. 81% percent of the participants mentioned that they are likely to apply the knowledge gained in their daily work activities. 96% percent of the participants rated "excellent" and "good" on the overall workshop (see Annex for the full survey results).

#### 2. Key Messages

#### Political commitment

- Political commitment is one of the most critical factors to ensuring the success of ODSC. Political will in the form of both upfront and ongoing commitment is needed for the survival and growth of ODSCs. Establishing continuous communication between the political and administrative levels for ODSC development, implementation, and improvement is critical to success. *For instance, ASAN Service is overseen by the State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan that has a peculiar concept based on multi-actor involvement, but with clear delineation of their functions to avoid any duplication.*
- There was a unanimous consensus that high-level political commitment is crucial for the success of ODSCs and that an ODSC reform cannot succeed in isolation. Rather, it must be accompanied by legal and institutional reforms that support citizen-centric service delivery.

#### Transformational leadership

- At a strategic level, strong leadership is essential to have a robust commitment to change at the highest organizational level to drive buy-in. Commitment ensures clarity of goals, determination, coordination, and participation of all stakeholders based on a whole-of-government approach. The key to ensuring effective leadership at the national level is to place the coordination of ODSC management as close as possible to the head of government and provide the full support of the other members of the government and non-governmental institutions that have an impact on the process. *For instance, the (access to information) a2i Programme of the Government of Bangladesh is housed in the Prime Minister's Office, the political nerve center of the country with the necessary mandate and convening authority.*
- Strong leadership and effective governance are crucial throughout the process, beginning with the holistic review and redesign of the underlying public sector operations to enhance collaboration, productivity, and innovation. *For instance, the establishment of ASAN Service is directly associated with the public administration reforms initiated by President Ilham Aliyev. All milestone decisions concerning the introduction of an ODSC in Azerbaijan emanated from his office.*

#### Institutional coordination and system thinking

- Institutional coordination is the key precondition for a successful introduction of ODSC. There was a unanimous consensus that institutional coordination is crucial for the success of ODSC. Public sector departments or agencies need to put in place institutional structures designed around citizen-centricity.
- Front-office functions in ODSC, such as physical spaces, customer service, and citizen feedback, are as important as deciding whether to integrate the back-end functions.

- To integrate front office operations with the necessary back-office coordination, officials first need to recognize the current hierarchical and siloed structure of public-sector bodies, which reduces efficiency and effectiveness across all stakeholder groups. The integration of the front and back office is to provide services aligned to the complete customer journey rather than to the dictates of agency silos. In line with a customer-centric approach, the optimal route is to understand citizen needs: redesigning the front office to interact effectively with the customer and realigning the back office to deliver through the front office. This approach allows multiple public sector agencies to come together to service citizens blurring the agency silos without affecting agency structures.
- The effective delivery of the services and proper public-relation (PR) campaigns play key roles in promoting public services from the national to the local level. Along with this, there was an emphasis on enhancing accessibility as one of the good governance methods.
- The foundation of a truly citizen-centric ODSC for public services lies in integrating data across numerous government agencies. The back-end integration is possible with the digital automation of service provision, which provides various services through a one-national portal system, simple document printing by KIOSK machines, and online counseling through the Government Complaints Counseling Center. Paperless business transactions and administration network systems are essential to save time and reduce redundant work while integrating the front and back office. Collaboration of dispatched public servants on a national level and mission tasking the ODSC team on a local level is crucial for the integration.

#### Coherence between national and local/regional level

- National and local governments play a critical role in transitioning administrative processes to e-services, ensuring that ethical rules and civilized behavior towards citizens are followed and providing more comfortable and cost-efficient services.
- A citizen-centric approach can bring coherence between the national and local/regional levels to provide coherent service delivery. For instance, the Government of Singapore tried to walk through the different moments in the life of a citizen by considering the multiple agencies citizens had to interact with and tried to make citizen interactions more streamlined and less time-consuming. This was done by interviewing the citizens and understanding their pain points at the front end. The government went beyond by integrating the related information and frontend services for users and streamlined these to the backend policies and processes across government agencies. They also went to the backend and understood the officers' pain points when delivering public services.
- The local governments are responsible for putting ODSC centers into practice; the central government legislates basic rules and standards for public servants to follow. The central government needs to encourage the local governments to introduce the best practices and the standard model by giving them prizes, financial aids, or praising the performance of local governments through press releases, among other means.

Members of the ODSC team are motivated to work together for one goal as they are evaluated as a team and share the outcomes of their performance. The team leader should direct and supervise them to collaborate and monitor the ODSC manual. Regular citizen feedback, such as satisfaction surveys and evaluations, is also an important trigger for collaboration.

#### Organizational structures and processes

- ODSC should be initiated by adopting a whole-of-government approach with the collaboration of relevant ministries and local governments. All stakeholders need to embrace digital technologies in ODSCs operations to increase work efficiency and productivity.
- Some countries use public-private partnerships in operating the ODSCs at the local and national levels. For instance, the Bangladeshi model of ODSCs is a public-private partnership that brought private sector partners such as banks and e-commerce players to run the ODSCs. Capacity development of such private sector entrepreneurs, ensuring the sustainability of the entrepreneur's business, and day-to-day coordination are some challenges the government faces. To overcome the capacity development challenges, use the structure and capacity of the existing public and private institutions such as banks, ICT companies, government ICT departments at the local level to develop the capacity of these entrepreneurs.

#### Financing

- Strong capacity and flexibility in financial management are considered a basic ingredient for reforming the OSS. While government support on OSS infrastructure, equipment, and high-tech supplies is preferable, public-private partnerships may solve financial challenges.
- Proper management covering financial, motivational, and other factors are crucial. A monthly employee evaluation system is also imperative to ensure service quality as it motivates employees to work hard and effectively deliver the services.

#### Digital technology and data management

- Ensuring widespread digital access to basic digital enablers such as mobile devices, connectivity, bank accounts, and digital identity is important, especially to the poor, persons with disabilities, and older persons. Consequently, digital literacy and participation should also be ensured. *For instance, the Digital Bangladesh Vision (2008) embodies the government's efforts to provide efficient, citizen-centric public services to all, bridge the digital divide from the bottom-up, and upholding the principle of leaving no one behind.*
- Providing service support for the important stages in citizens' lives is possible by analyzing the citizens' lifecycle from birth to death. Moreover, digital channels can enable governments to put all the services coherently.

- Mobile buses and increased online service access through national portals are helpful if citizens have difficulty accessing the OSS in their regions.
- Governments need to be agile in addressing the difficulties brought about by the pandemic. The utilization of an online queuing system on the national portal's website and the app is useful in maintaining social distancing, especially among citizens who may be reluctant to visit the OSS.
- The establishment of a national helpline or a call center performs as a substitute for OSS. Citizens can access the contact center if the digital channels are inaccessible. In addition, governments should also implement cross-referrals so that citizens can obtain diverse information on employment, tax payment, rent payment, housing loans, and more all in one call.
- It is important to increase internet penetration for the success of OSS and for citizens who do not have high internet literacy and accessibility to have the full benefit of the service.

#### Stakeholders' engagement

- The central government needs to provide centers, identify Digital Centers in every local government institution, hosting of data centers, and internet connectivity across the entire country. At the national level, many private sector partners such as banks and e-commerce players need to be engaged to coordinate the ODSCs.
- Public-private partnership is essential for the sustainability of any model, especially to address day-to-day coordination, establish a platform connecting all the entrepreneurs, local government, and service providers. The Peer-to-peer learning model is also effective in overcoming challenges in stakeholders' engagement.
- It is recommended that programmes be implemented to allow public servants with high potentials to learn from the leading innovative companies on service analytics, customer experience, digital design, and management. For effective service delivery, special training for state entities should be provided on ethics, developing performance-based motivation schemes, business management, and communication skills, particularly listening.
- Government can involve ICT and private sectors to build partnerships for innovative solutions. *The Singaporean government is implementing partnerships with the ICT and private sectors: the Co-development Partners Model and the Talent Attachment Programme (see detail in Sub-session 3.6).*

#### Monitoring, reporting, and evaluation

• Governments must take a holistic approach to performance measurement and monitoring by combining citizen feedback and operational data to provide a balanced view of performance. Performance information communicated to the public should focus on the desired outcomes for the community and citizens, not only on the needs of

the departments or agencies coordinating the services. This approach ensures that citizens' perspectives inform monitoring of what is succeeding and what is not. Government departments need to understand public perceptions and concerns and offer an open, two-way flow of information to address these concerns.

- The effective receipt and handling of complaints and petitions require specific guidance from the national and local governments. Third-party evaluation could be conducted to analyze how the one-stop service centers have increased transparency and accountability. This independent party can provide the government with a detailed report recommending strategies to overcome the challenges and enhance service delivery. Changing and promoting a service culture is bound to take considerable time. But incentivizing and training officials consistently can lead to a good outcome. A campaign for good service can be established through customized service and a kind service attitude.
- It is vital to establish a specific monitoring and assessment department, consisting of ٠ several divisions such as monitoring and assessment divisions. For instance, the monitoring and assessment portfolio of the State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan (SAPSSI) has a primary role in managing the coordinated activity of state entities in ASAN Service centers, organizing the delivery of services in conformity with the ASAN principles and legal norms, and conducting regular assessment of quality and transparency of services with the ultimate goal of preserving the high customer satisfaction rate. A dedicated department within SAPSSI employs several tools, such as surveillance cameras recording the service process in the centers, the onsite presence of the department's representative, and oral, paper-based, and online surveys among citizens. It also collects and analyses statistical data on rendered services, citizen flow, and applications, assesses the performance of service rendering officers, prepares periodic reports, investigates the citizens' complaints and violations of service-related rules and regulations by service rendering officers, and takes necessary measures in that regard.<sup>4</sup>
- Establishing quantitative and qualitative indicators and evaluation methods to test the success and quality of the service provided to users is essential to evaluate the services effectively. The quantitative indicators include how long it takes to conduct a transaction from application to issuance of a document, how many services are delivered in a month/year, and performance comparison between similar ODSCs. Citizens' satisfaction, evaluation (grade/score), and proposals for streamlining processes and suggestions for service improvement are qualitative indicators.

#### Mechanisms for citizen feedback

• The government needs to listen to the opinions of citizens, lawmakers, and politicians. For instance, lawmakers can provide positive and negative criticism of the policy to improve public service delivery. They need to keep monitoring policies that affect the citizens' safety and comfort of life because citizens are voting power. User-friendly

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Statute of the Monitoring and Assessment Department of the State Agency, accessed September 25, 2016, http://www.vxsida.gov.az/redirect/post/pid/560

services and customized services are also useful for communicating progress to the citizens, lawmakers, and political leaders to get their support continuously.

• When revamping their services, walking the citizen's journey, interviewing them, and tracking the feedback rating are methods governments should consider. It is important to assess whether OSSs continue to meet citizen's needs, as these may change over time. Gathering views from citizens and businesses can help establish what is working well and what can be improved and foster a culture of continuous improvement in one-stop-shop centers.

# The key measures to implement ODSCs are listed in Figure 1 and are detailed further below.



#### Figure 1. Key measures to implement ODSCs

Source: Shim B. (2021). Key measures to implement ODSCs [PowerPoint slides]. Peer-to-Peer Learning International Workshop on One-Door-Service Centers (ODSCs). August 4, 2021

#### System-level

- Citizens demand citizen-centric service standards with greater accountability and transparency, which forces public institutions to respond positively. Citizen-centric service standards through the passing of legislation setting out the citizens' right to information and service standards that are mandated by law. This provides positive evidence of the public sector's desire to place its citizens in a central position and assists in driving citizen trust and belief in public institutions.
- Develop a strategy to ensure a whole-of-society approach for citizen-centric service delivery. The citizen-centric approach allows for coherent service delivery by simplifying the multiple services and agencies that citizens have to access to get public service.
- Define the required changes in the legislative and regulatory framework. Need to enable regulatory and legislative framework, together with supporting budgets for cross-agency transformation.

#### **Organization level**

- When seeking to break down hierarchical structures, emphasis should be placed on making agency silos more networked rather than abandoning them altogether. Assess the need for institutional and administrative reform.
- Effective implementation of OSS requires the commitment of funds at an initial stage and a sustainable source of funding for the functioning of the OSS service. The funding sustainability should be guaranteed by the national or regional budget, through the finance ministry, with a particular fund for running the OSS.
- Successful ODSC models usually involved commissioning a fullscale feasibility study, resulting in a detailed roadmap and a phased approach. The ODSC feasibility study helps define objectives, demand, budgeting, financing model, and a prioritized list of services to be included in the ODSC. Feasibility study usually entailed the terms of reference for business process re-engineering (BPR) and a realistic assessment of the need for policy and legal framework re-adjustment and administrative simplification. Choose a financing model: free access, subsidized services, or cost recovery.
- Define the monitoring and evaluation framework, including Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). It is important to define and agree on a balanced set of measures that can be used to determine what success looks like, gauge whether success has been achieved, and identify what might need to change to get there. Monitoring and tracking the performance of service delivery transformations require the development of key metrics essential to the effective governance and support of the transformation programme.
- Innovation and continuous improvement are the keys to the public sector's ability to continuously deliver on its citizen promise and sustainability of OSS transformation. Innovation requires business re-engineering processes to enable and equip the OSS and people involved in service delivery to meet immediate citizen demands and develop performance improvements and efficiencies.
- The most significant developments in the design and functioning of OSS are linked to technological advances. The availability and spread of new technologies are opening new channels for governments to provide information and services to their citizens, expanding the possibilities for service access and interactions. These include online solutions and digital platforms, facilitating data exchange between government entities and citizens, and creating national ID systems as unique identifiers that can be used to catalog services, documents and target citizens for specific services.

#### Individual-level

• Determine the extent of the back-end integration and required data exchange. In line with a citizen-centric approach, the optimal route is to start with understanding citizen needs – redesigning the front office to interact effectively with the customer and realigning the back office to effectively deliver through the front office, before attempting to address the integration of individual agencies and departments. This

approach allows multiple public sector agencies to come together to service citizens blurring the agency silos without affecting agency structures.

- Delivering tailored, citizen-focused services require transformation at all levels of the organization to empower both staff and citizens within individual agencies and across public sector departments or agencies. Through involvement, build a hunger for success. Work with people who will either implement the change or will be impacted by it. Ensure that they are appropriately engaged in what success will look like in practice and what it means for them.
- Citizen feedback is a powerful tool for understanding citizens' experience and satisfaction with public services and developing strategies to improve those services. The one-stop-shop model should ensure an ongoing, iterative approach to incorporating citizen feedback into service design, processes, and customer interfaces.

### 3. Key Learnings

- The key learning for organizing the similar workshop is to provide enough time for interaction and discussion for the participants with the panelists. It may also may have been helpful to facilitate smaller group discussions in the room to make sure everyone follows.
- The structure of the guidance to panelists, in terms of the clear questions and timeframes shared with them long in advance of the event, was hugely helpful in keeping people on point, and on time as much as possible. This would be helpful for the institutional learning for UN DESA and resident agencies in Laos in planning similar future events.

#### 4. Next Steps

- As a follow-up of the workshop, UN DESA, in cooperation with the RCO and UNDP in Lao, is organizing an inter-ministerial technical workshop on 28 October 2021. The inter-ministerial technical workshop will focus on how to make ODSCs effective, inclusive and accountable. It will provide the opportunity to explore the challenges, trends, innovative practices and lessons learned on how to promote integrated service delivery.
- The inter-ministerial technical workshop will be followed by the high level interministerial meeting in November 2021.
- Also, there was some discussions about how the key recommendations and presentations from the other countries included in the report would be distilled for Lao Government officials at a more technical level, including in terms of translation of key points, focus group discussions and steps in how they can incorporate these learnings into their own work, and the work of their respective ministries and departments.

#### 5. Minutes - Peer-To-Peer Learning International Workshop On ODSCs

#### 5.1 Opening

**Opening by the Session Moderator: Ms. Adriana Alberti**, Chief, Programme Management and Capacity Development Unit, DPIDG, UN DESA, opened and welcomed speakers and participants to the Workshop. The opening session began with high-level opening remarks from H.E. Mr. Thongchan Manixay, Minister of Home Affairs, Lao PDR, Ms. Ricarda Rieger, Resident Coordinator a.i., United Nations Office in Lao PDR and Mr. Juwang Zhu, Director, DPIDG / UN DESA.

**H.E. Mr. Thongchan Manixay,** in his opening remarks, welcomed participants and thanked the UN DESA, UNDP, and UN RCO to hold the "Peer-to-Peer Learning International Workshop on One-Door-Service Centers" with Lao PDR at the heart of the agenda design. He highlighted the success and challenges of ODSCs in Lao PDR and how this Workshop is relevant to Lao PDR. MOHA has committed to expanding the number of ODSCs to cover at least 50% of all the districts by 2025 as per its current five-year sectoral plan of MOHA (2021 – 2025). He expressed to collaborate with the UN agencies who have been supporting the project and the potential development partners to materialize this goal. Along with the ODSC expansion plan, MOHA has also been working to improve the institutional arrangements of ODSCs through revising workflow processes of the ODSC services, creating an ODSC dashboard for transparent monitoring, and creating mobile applications of ODSC tracking.

Mr. Manixay emphasized the need for a whole-of-government approach and concerted efforts and commitments among top leadership and officials working on the ground to overcome the challenges of coordination among governmental agencies in strengthening the ODSCs. He noted that the Workshop came at such an opportune time to learn from the invited panelists. He committed to holding an inter-ministerial meeting as a follow-up of this event to bring all the relevant ministries and governmental agencies in Lao PDR together to discuss ODSC development and strengthen the coordination.

**Ms. Ricarda Rieger**, Resident Coordinator a.i., United Nations Office in Lao PDR reiterated the commitment of the government of Lao PDR in shaping the country's sustainable development, including through the SDGs and in the 9th National Socio-Economic Development Plan (NSEDP). She lauded the timely organization of the Workshop given the huge role played by the One Door Service Centers in putting people at the center of transparent, efficient, and effective service delivery, including right down at the local level. The transparency allows people to understand better, monitor, and gain greater control of the services they receive. The efficiency of the ODSCs reflects the needs of people to receive services urgently and not to have to commit huge amounts of their time in engaging with the government, instead of saving time to focus on the things that matter most to them. And most importantly, the effectiveness of the services can be ensured by using the ODSC model to capture feedback from people on how government services can be improved. She stressed that the ODSC model results from using feedback from people to reform public administration and putting people's experiences first, creating great government services, which is critical to continued improvement.

Ms. Rieger noted that the ODSCs have helped drive greater inter-ministerial and departmental coordination, which has been a long-held frustration around the world in our efforts to advance sustainable development in an interconnected and interdependent world. As much as the

problems we face do not exist in isolation or the solutions we need, this is no different for service delivery. She called attention to work together across different ministries and departments to ensure that people get the full array of services they need by moving outside the silos.

Ms. Rieger echoed the UN's commitment to promoting this human-centered approach to implement the 9th NSEDP and achieve the SDGs by putting those people and groups traditionally left behind by such development processes even more centrally in work and focus. The UN's support will continue to promote the ODSC model across the Lao PDR through a whole-of-government and whole-of-society approach.

**Mr. Juwang Zhu,** Director of DPIDG / UN DESA, delivered the opening remarks on behalf of Mr. Liu Zhenmin, Under-Secretary-General for Economic and Social Affairs. He commended the government of Lao PDR for its efforts to improve on ODSCs by promoting effective, inclusive, and accountable public service delivery, which is critical to the advancement of the Sustainable Development Goals, also known as the SDGs. He stressed the immediate priority to improve access to basic services, healthcare, safe water and sanitation, and education, which requires effective governance and strong public institutions.

The 11 principles of effective governance for sustainable development<sup>5</sup>, developed by the UN Committee of Experts on Public Administration and endorsed by the United Nations Economic and Social Council in 2018, provide a useful framework for building effective, accountable, and inclusive institutions at all levels. Such institutions are essential to achieve the shared vision for the people and the planet embodied in the UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. In particular, Principle number 3 focused on collaboration and coordination, calling on institutions at all levels of government and in all sectors to work together and jointly with non-state actors towards the same objective.

Mr. Zhu reiterated that the Workshop's objective is to promote mutual learning to help service delivery by strengthening institutional coordination and partnerships. The coordination and partnership will contribute to developing a roadmap for integrated service in Lao PDR and other countries, also taking advantage of the opportunities offered by digital technologies. He assured that UN DESA will continue to work with UNDP and other partners in other parts of the UN system in supporting Lao PDR and other UN member states in their efforts to strengthen capacities to implement the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development through effective public service delivery.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> United Nations Economic and Social Council (2018). Principles of effective governance for sustainable development. Official Records, 2018. Supplement No. 24. E/2018/44-E/C.16/2018/8, para. 31. Retrieved from https://publicadministration.un.org/Portals/1/Images/CEPA/Principles\_of\_effective\_governance\_english.pdf (last accessed on September 27, 2021).

#### **5.2 Overview Presentation on ODSCs**

On half of **Mr. Laty Phimmachack**, Deputy Director-General, Department of Local Administration, MOHA, Lao PDR, **Mr. Pongphon**, the Head of Local Administration Division, presented the overview of ODSCs in Lao PDR. Mr. Pongphon explained the background of ODSCs concerning different decrees and notices issued by the Prime Minister to guide the development of ODSCs in the country. He also highlighted the success stories of ODSCs, such as the rapid expansion of ODSCs across the country from just one ODSC in 2006 to 44 in 2021. The number of services in each ODSC has also increased to provide more public services to citizens. He also mentioned key challenges of ODSCs, such as the coordination and commitment from top leadership.

#### **5.3 Overview Presentation on International Experiences of ODSCs**

**Mr. Aslam** Alam, Chairman, and Executive Director, Bangladesh Institute for Information Literacy and Sustainable Development, Bangladesh, highlighted the international experience of ODSCs.

Effective, inclusive, and accountable public service delivery is the key to achieving SDGs. The ODSC system has a proven advantage over other service delivery models. Governments worldwide are making efforts to create an effective, inclusive, and accountable public service delivery mechanism. The ODSC system is a physical and/or digital mechanism, which may be a stationary or a mobile service point, where citizens and/or businesses can access all relevant information relating to all public services and conduct all transactions without the necessity of visiting multiple public offices multiple times. There are many rationales behind the ODSC system, including:

- 1. Greater citizen awareness and expectations
- 2. As a critical component of regulatory delivery
- 3. As a mechanism to increase accountability
- 4. As a mechanism to reduce corruption
- 5. As a mechanism of social inclusion
- 6. To address fragmentation in public service delivery; to increase citizen satisfaction with public service delivery
- 7. To increase citizen trust in government
- 8. Due to global competition; and
- 9. To achieve UN SDGs.

UN DESA developed nine building blocks for readiness assessment on institutional arrangements for policy coherence to implement the Agenda 2030 for sustainable development (UN DESA-DPIDG, 2020)<sup>6</sup> that could be utilized to design and implement the ODSC system. These nine building blocks, which have system-wide implications, include:

- 1. Political commitment
- 2. Transformative leadership, human resources, and changing mindsets
- 3. System thinking and policy linkages
- 4. Organizational structures and processes
- 5. Financing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://unpan.un.org/capacity-development/otc/self-assessment-tools/self-assessment-questionnaire/

- 6. Digital technology and data governance
- 7. Coherence between national and local/ regional levels
- 8. Stakeholders' engagement; and
- 9. Monitoring, reporting, and evaluation processes.

The ODSC front office planning usually involves issues, such as:

- 1. Operation and management of ODSC front offices
- 2. Spatial arrangements
- 3. Financing issues
- 4. Service fees
- 5. arrangement of human resources for front offices
- 6. Capacity building of front-office employees
- 7. Information dissemination services
- 8. Types of services to be provided
- 9. Physical layout
- 10. Queue management system
- 11. Document exchange mechanism
- 12. Building, furniture, and equipment
- 13. Customer feedback and grievances
- 14. Accessibility and inclusiveness
- 15. Amenities to be provided to customers
- 16. Monitoring and reporting mechanism
- 17. Evaluation of services provided by ministries, departments, and agencies

However, operationalization of the ODSC system usually faces multiple challenges, such as resistance and non-cooperation from legacy bureaucracy, silo mentality of public organizations and officials, financing, human resources, legal reform, institutional reform, business-process re-engineering/simplification of administrative procedures, ICT infrastructure, interoperability of data and systems, and effective monitoring and evaluation mechanism. To overcome challenges, countries around the world have adopted various strategies, which include:

- High-level political support
- A whole-of-government approach
- Effective administrative reform programme
- A medium to a long-term investment plan
- Gradual roll-out of the ODSC system
- An effective horizontal coordination mechanism
- Back-office strengthening
- Training and motivation of employees
- Flexible and adjustable state agency
- Leveraging technology for service delivery
- Collaborative partnerships
- Addressing vulnerable groups and ensuring accessibility
- Overcoming digital divide
- Innovation and branding
- Forming a coalition of change-makers within a government
- Modification and adaptation of international experiences, rather than wholesale copying

#### **5.4 Session 1: Critical Role of Leadership for Effective ODSCs**

**Moderator**: **Ms. Adriana Alberti**, Chief, Programme Management and Capacity Development Unit, Division for Public Institutions and Digital Government (DPIDG) UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA)

Panelists were asked to respond to the following questions:

- How has the support from the highest level of government, prime minister, president, or ministers influenced the functional implementation and improvement of one-stop shops for service delivery?
- What concrete decisions from the national leadership facilitated inclusive and effective service delivery?
- What were the key pillars of your country's strategy and roadmap for effective and inclusive service delivery?

**Mr. Abdul Aliyev**, Head, International Relations Department, The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan

**Mr. Abdul Aliyev,** in response to the first question, indicated that before the ODSCs were introduced in Azerbaijan, most services were rendered in a scattered way by different organizations. However, these methods of delivery were not that effective since there was a lot of incoherence. Implementing one-stop shops centers for service delivery received direct support from the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Precisely, he stated that political and financial support for establishing the service centers came from the highest level of government.

Without positive and adequate support from the government, the establishment and functional implementation of ODSCs will not be possible. Under this arrangement, The State Agency reports only directly to the president and does not report to any other structure and cabinet Minister. This model took into account the cultural, economic, and political situation of the country.

On the second question, Mr. Abdul Aliyev stated that two concrete legislative Acts were promulgated in favor of the ODSCs, which include:

- Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan dated 13 July 2012 on measures to establish the State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan to improve the services delivered to citizens by government agencies
- Order of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan dated 17 September 2012 on measures related to implementing the pilot project to establish "ASAN Service" centers of the State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Regarding the final question, he explained that one of the key pillars of Azerbaijan's strategy in ensuring effective service delivery is introducing ASAN Service Index. This Index measures the quality of public service delivery based on data and ASAN Service standards. The results of the assessment are announced annually to the public to maintain accountability and publicity. • The advantages of the essential index are as follows: ensuring the delivery of public services to the citizens, ensuring transparency in the provision of public services. The work of control and complaint mechanisms for public services improves the efficiency and quality of public service, accelerating the process of overgrowing public services.

Another aspect is the establishment of an electronic register of public services. The President signed a decree on measures to establish this electronic register of public services. This decree aims to ensure the:

- Analysis and forecasting capabilities based on services by collecting and system addressing and promoting public services in a single source.
- Eliminating duplication is the provision of services and creating new types of service. All the services in the register are accessible with the ASAN Service Index. Through these initiatives, Azerbaijan has been two times winners of the UN Public Service Award in 2015 and 2019, respectively.

Through a follow-up question on what steps have been initiated to ensure that the ODSCs are inclusive for persons with disabilities, older persons, and other vulnerable groups given that persons with disabilities constitute nearly 6.4% of the population in Azerbaijan?

**Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev**, Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, in response on behalf of **Mr. Abdul Aliyev**, indicated that some measures had been taken in ASAN Service Centers for disabled persons and disabled persons. These include:

- First, there are special paths and tracks arranged in all service centers for handicapped and persons with disabilities to find their ways for the service. It directs them to the services.
- Second is the use of Braille alphabets, which mentions all the names of the services, the required documents for the One door service, and the respective amount of fees mentioned in the Braille alphabet for visually impaired persons.
- Thirdly, mobile services exist within the scope of the mobile services with VIP services. Citizens are paid a small additional amount for these additional services. For example, citizens who cannot come to the centers can call the call center and assist in ordering the services right through their address, homes, hotels, or workplace, and disabled persons are exempted from paying additional.
- Lastly, there is the innocence service according to existing capacity. Many people are living with disabilities. They work together in the front office, back office, and even in the central administration of the agency. These are the facilities arranged for citizens who are disabled or living with disabilities.

**Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi**, Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam, in response to the questions, emphasized the following:

• Quang Ninh is the pioneering province in Vietnam, adopting a new One-Stop-Shop model known as the Public Administration Service Center at the provincial and district level. This is partly due to the strong support and guidance from the central government that Quang Ninh has received.

- The Government of Vietnam has embarked on Public Administration Reform since the 1990s and continued to prioritize service delivery and good governance in the upcoming 2021-2030 development strategy. While the Central Government of Vietnam established the overall direction and vision for the promotion of One-Stop Shops under the Public Administration Reform program, it was Quang Ninh province that developed a Project to establish and organize the operation of provincial one-stop shops model called the "Provincial Public Administration Service Center (PPASC) and District-level public administration service centers." After developing the idea, Quang Ninh then secured approval from the competent central agencies to implement the project in the province.
- On October 28 of 2015, the Prime Minister officially approved the pilot establishment of the Quang Ninh Provincial Public Administration Service Center under the Provincial People's Committee. Almost a month later, Quang Ninh Provincial People's Committee issued a Decision defining the functions, tasks, and organizational structure of the PPASC, and the regulation on coordination of activities between PPASC and other departments, agencies, People's Committees of districts, towns, cities and a number of vertical agencies in the province. Over time, these regulations continue to be adapted, supplemented, and updated to achieve the overall objective of the PPASC, as the initiative evolves, and ensure consistency with the legal regulations, the actual situation, and bring an effective and satisfactory service for people who use our services.
- Since the new Provincial and District Public Administration Service Center was established and put into operation; Quang Ninh Provincial Party Committee and People's Committee regularly direct the Heads of departments, agencies, and chairpersons of the local People's Committees to enhance the responsibility of the leaders in directing the implementation of solutions to improve efficiency, the quality of operations of public administration center at all levels.
- Most recently, in March 2021, the Prime Minister issued Decision 468 on Revamping the One-Stop Shops (OSS) model to enable citizen-centered service delivery, further digitalizing and utilizing data collected at the OSS improving administration efficiency. And Quang Ninh has constantly developed and updated many mechanisms, policies, regulations, and directives to enhance the effectiveness and efficiency of public administration service centers, adapting and tailoring to the local context to continuously improve the overall business process, quality of service delivery, and citizen satisfaction.
- Key to the province's success is planning and strategizing. The province promulgates implementation plans, with specific roadmaps and assigns responsibilities to Heads of departments, agencies, and chairpersons of local People's Committees in reviewing and bringing 100% of administrative procedures into the settlement at the OSS, selecting administrative procedures that are eligible for implementation according to the principle of 05-on the spot: *"Receiving, appraising, approving, stamping and returning results"* right at the Centers; reviewing, reducing, simplifying, publicizing and ensuring transparency of administrative procedures by the competent authorities. As a result, the agency managed to reduce by 40-50% in handling administrative procedures compared to the minimum time in regulations.

• In sum, reforming the Public Administration and OSS is a priority of the Vietnamese government and Quang Ninh to foster improved government efficiency, transparency, accountability, citizen satisfaction, and help develop the e-government. Since Quang Ninh pioneering the reformed OSS, the Provincial and District Public Administration Service Center, the perception and confidence of citizens and businesses in Quang Ninh governance performance has constantly improved. Quang Ninh has topped the national rankings in the Provincial business environment, the Provincial Governance and Public Administration Performance Index or PAPI administered by UNDP Vietnam, and several government-led measurements of administrative reform capacity and citizen satisfaction in the past few years.

#### **5.5 Session 2: Institutional Coordination**

Moderator - Mr. Bokyun Shim, Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA

Panelists were asked to respond to the following questions:

- How does institutional coordination facilitate in practice the successful operation of your country's One-Stop-Shop system, and who is responsible for coordination?
- How did you promote collaboration mechanisms among government officials?
- How did you succeed to integrate front office operations with the necessary back-office coordination, and what were the main steps?

**Ms. Junny Kim**, Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea

**Ms. Junny Kim,** in response to the first question, highlighted that the Korean One-Stop Service largely relies on the online service system at the national level and the local district service center at the local level. She further explained that:

- Different divisions in local government collaborate not only with each other but also with other public agencies such as the tax office.
- The central government has developed the online service portal system and stipulated a regulation stating that the documentation submitted at the one-stop service is valid for other offices.
- In line with this, the central government specifies manuals for processing one-stop service requests.
- The main purpose of this center is to approve multi-licenses or issue multi-permissions faster and easier for citizens when applying for business registration.
- All one-stop service counters are installed at local district service centers. Here, local governments are responsible because municipalities have autonomy and self-governing administration to meet their citizens' needs and requests.
- These one-stop services have various types to serve different situations. Hence, the most successful operation is to bring public servants of different divisions and assign them a task to provide multi-approved licenses in one step.

For the second question, **Ms. Junny Kim** indicated that while the local governments are responsible for putting one-stop service centers into practice, the central government, thus, the Ministry of the Interior and Safety (MOIS), legislates basic rules and standards for public servants to follow. These include:

• The central government encourages the local governments to introduce the best practices and the standard model by giving them prizes, financial aids, or praising performances of local governments through press releases.

- Members of the one-stop service team are motivated to work together for one goal as they are evaluated as a team and share the outcomes of their performance. In this regard, the team leader should direct and supervise them to collaborate and monitor the one-stop manual.
- Finally, regular citizen feedback such as satisfaction grade and evaluation is also an important motive for collaboration.

In response to the third question, **Ms. Junny Kim** responded by introducing the Korean government portal system named Gov24, which integrates front office operations with back-office coordination.

- She highlighted that such integration is possible with the digital automation of service provision, which provides various services through a one-national portal system, simple document printing by KIOSK machines, and online counseling through the Government Complaints Counseling Center.
- She also mentioned that paperless business transactions and administration network systems are essential to save time and reduce redundant work while integrating the front and back office.
- Similarly, the information sharing system among national ministries, agencies, local governments, and private banks has enabled communication among them with the document and application.
- Last but not least, she concluded that collaboration of dispatched public servants on a national level and mission tasking the one-stop service team on a local level is crucial for the integration.

**Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi**, Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam, in her response highlighted that:

- The Provincial People's Committee has promulgated the Regulation on coordination of activities between the PPASC and relevant agencies, which act as the basis for the coordination role played by the Provincial and district Public Administration Service Centers. In effect, departments and agencies have the responsibility to coordinate in reviewing administrative procedures, developing business processes, collection of fees and charges, and using second seals for handling the administrative procedures; manage and implement regimes and policies for officials of line agencies who assigned to work at the new OSS; and receive and handle feedbacks, recommendations, complaints and denunciations of organizations and individual. Whereas the District People's Committees is required to coordinate with the district OSS in directing the performance, proposing solutions to improve the quality and efficiency of the district OSSs, carry out the settlement of inter-related administrative procedures according to regulations, in effect, they are given the responsibility of adapting the procedures at the user face.
- To enable the implementation of full handling of administrative procedures or the 05on the spot "*Receiving, appraising, approving, stamping and returning results,*" the Provincial Party Committee and the Provincial People's Committee have directed the Heads of departments, agencies, in terms of ensuring the necessary capacity, including by appointing people with the right professional qualifications, work experience, moral qualities, and good interpersonal skills. These officers must be at the Deputy Head of

Department level or higher to work at the Center; they are given full authority to directly handle administrative procedures at the Center, while at the same time, review and promoting the assignment to deputy levels, decentralization, and maximum authorization for public servants and public employees to be appointed to work at the Center for appraisal and approval of administrative procedures.

• The Provincial Public Administration Service Center is under the direction of the Quang Ninh Provincial People's Committee, operating at the same level as other departments, agencies, and sectors. But the Director of the Provincial Center has certain advantages in coordinating the implementation of work because of the function and responsibility provided, which enable clear people, clear work, clear settlement time, and a unified process; and has the responsibility of assisting the Chairman of the Provincial People's Committee to manage all activities in the Center.

Two other panelists, **Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev** from Azerbaijan and **Mr. Anir Chowdhury** from Bangladesh, were asked to respond to these questions:

- What are some examples of effective strategies and innovative practices you have utilized in your country for coordination from the national to local level to enhance public service delivery?
- What challenges did you face, how did you overcome them, and what are the lessons learned?

**Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev**, Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan

**Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev,** in response to the first question, mentioned that Azerbaijan is a unitary republic. Hence, services are regulated from a single center at the national level to reach out to citizens at all levels. He further explained that:

- When Azerbaijan began establishing the one-stop-shop, it started first in the capital Baku as a pilot project and increased the number of centers with increased public trust.
- The effective delivery of the services and proper PR campaigns played key roles in utilizing the coordination of the services from the national to the local level.
- They specifically carried out PR campaigns throughout Azerbaijan and afterward created their own radio named ASAN radio.
- Along with this, there was an emphasis on enhancing accessibility as one of the good governance methods.
- As part of such efforts, they created Mobile ASAN buses to arrange the same facilities with ASAN service centers in remote and rural regions of Azerbaijan. The buses regularly travel across the country and render services for those residing in remote and rural areas.

Regarding the second question, **Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev** indicated that there were two primary challenges:

- There were initial concerns among public agencies operating at ASAN service centers that some of their powers might be taken away. However, none of their powers have been taken away as public service agencies seconded their employees under the ASAN umbrella.
- The second challenge was the service quality problems in the early phases, especially regarding human resources.
  - In response to the second challenge, they offered financial incentives to the employees of those agencies operating at ASAN service centers. Along with this, tailor-made training programs were implemented to increase the hard and soft skills of the workers.
  - In ASAN, every employee has their own training portfolio where the specific training needs are written down. Preliminary training is also provided to new employees before they start working.
- Two important lessons have been learned: First, proper and just management covering financial, motivational, and other factors are crucial. Second, a monthly employee evaluation system is also imperative to ensure service quality as it motivates employees to work hard and effectively to deliver the services.

**Mr. Anir Chowdhury**, Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh

**Mr. Anir Chowdhury,** in response to the first question, said that the Prime Minister's Office nurtured coordination across the entire government, and a2i Programme was also established in this office. He further revealed that:

- The political will to offer services within 4 km of every citizen in Bangladesh motivated the birth of the one-stop service centers.
- The cabinet office played an important role in coordinating across the entire government at the local level.
- The Ministry of Local Government provided the hosting of centers and identified Digital Centers in every local government institution.
- The Ministry of Posts, Telecommunications, and ICT provided the hosting of data centers and internet connectivity across the entire country to each of these centers.
- At the national level, Bangladesh brought in many private sector partners such as banks, e-commerce players to provide coordination.

Regarding the second question, **Mr. Anir Chowdhury** replied that there were three challenges.

• The first challenge was that they had to develop the capacities of the entrepreneurs running these centers, especially their ICT and communication capacities, as most of them came from rural areas.

- To address this challenge, they utilized the structure and capacity of the existing public and private institutions such as banks and ICT companies to develop the capacities of these entrepreneurs. Along with this, they developed trainers from these entrepreneurs, which allowed entrepreneurs to support other entrepreneurs.
- The second challenge was financial sustainability. In the very beginning, they provided one-time funding to equip the centers, and after that, entrepreneurs had to run the business. For example, they had to replenish equipment and continue the local marketing efforts by charging small fees for every service rendered.
- Finally, the coordination challenges were at the operational level. To address this challenge, they introduced competition dashboards, competitions, and awards to the local level. Also, there was a collaboration among local elected representatives, local administrators, and central ministries working together to monitor the performances of these entrepreneurs.

# 5.6 Session 3: Structural Organization, Processes, Digitization, and Financing of ODSCs

Moderator: Mr. Keping Yao, Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert, UNPOG/DPIDG/UN DESA

Panelists from Korea and Singapore were asked to respond to the following questions:

- How did you undertake a business process re-engineering to transform your one-stop shops into an efficient networked system? How did you eliminate unnecessary documentation to simplify the re-engineering process?
- What regulatory, legislative, and policy changes did your country adopt to facilitate public service delivery?
- What did your country do to ensure that public services are fit for citizens' needs? Please elaborate on your simplification and single-window design approaches.

**Ms. Junny Kim**, Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea

In response to the first question, **Ms. Junny Kim** stated that the Korean government set up a Master Plan of National e-Government Promotion. The MOIS took the initiative.

- It was launched under the whole-of-government approach with the collaboration of related ministries and local governments, embracing the administrative process and public service provision with ICT.
- Secondly, the Korean government computerized all public administration processes to increase work efficiency and productivity.
- An example is the Electronic Data Interchange (EDI) system and e-Approval, or the e-Reporting workflow system. As documents can get approval and authorization and can be transferred to other organizations electronically through the data interchange system, this is provided as the basic structure of the one-stop service.

**Ms. Kim** then introduced the regulatory and legislative background of public service delivery and emphasized the three Acts below:

- The Administrative Procedure Act was enacted in 1996 and was revised 16 times. It regulates and manages the overall procedure of public administration so that unfavorable dispositions or disadvantageous actions will not be imposed on people. The Act ensures citizen participation in the government and protects citizen's rights.
- The Civil Petitions Treatment Act was enacted in 1997 and was revised 14 times. It ensures citizens of a fair and legal settlement of civil petitions by requiring the government to respond to petitions within a certain period and protect the petitioner's rights.
- The e-Government Act was enacted in 2001 and was revised 33 times. It was first enacted when Korea started digital governance and included an e-Business standard, procedure, and the mechanism of public administration automation. It also gives ground for public service improvement through e-Government technology. While the Act is

comparatively new compared to the two above, it is worth noting that it was revised twice more than the others due to the rapid technology development in public service delivery.

Lastly, **Ms. Kim** introduced that the Korean government implements the following to address its citizen's needs:

- *Life-cycle Services:* The Korean government provides comprehensive service support for the important stages in the citizen's lifecycle, such as childbirth registration and parent-death registration. For example, in the case of pregnancy and childbirth, citizens can sign up for childbirth registration and more than ten benefit applications all at once. This includes child-raising allowances, voucher requests, and utility exemptions. In the case of a parent's death, citizens can discover their inherited properties such as owned real estate, pensions, automobiles, and bank accounts within one application. This results from the tax office, bank authorities, pension agencies, local government, and MOIS's collaboration.
- *Proactive Customized Services*: These services alert people on their tax payment deadlines, driver's license expiration dates, and annual medical checkups.
- *Non-stop and One-stop Services:* Public services in Korea are all available on mobile apps, through the online portal (Gov24), KIOSKs, and even the ATMs. This allows the public to issue any certificate or document while significantly reducing the time to receive them.

**Ms. Lee Mui Ling**, Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore

**Ms. Lee Mui Ling** responded to the first question by discussing the Singaporean government's "Service Journey" Approach of Transforming Citizens' Experiences in redesigning public services.

- A citizen-centric approach brought together the related tasks across different parties to provide coherent service delivery. The state tried to walk through the different moments in the life of a citizen by considering the multiple agencies citizens had to interact with and tried to make citizen interactions more streamlined and less time-consuming. This was done by interviewing the citizens and understanding their pain points at the front end.
- The state went beyond by integrating the related information and frontend services for users and streamlined these to the backend policies and processes across government agencies. They also went to the backend and understood the officers' pain points when delivering public services.

**Ms.** Lee took the explanation further by illustrating how the Singaporean government is reaching out to the poor and vulnerable.

• While conducting landscape research for the poor and vulnerable in applying for government assistance, the Singaporean government discovered that agencies that offer financial and social assistance, agencies that offer hospitalization and outpatient clinic

subsidy, agencies that offer school textbooks and uniforms, and the agency that offers financial assistance to the poor and disabled for broadband and smartphone subsidy were all not only different but also required numerous forms.

• From this experience, the government started asking the fundamental question of having one digital form and sharing the form's data across different agencies so that citizens would not have to go to different agencies repeatedly searching for public services.

Similar to Korea's case, Singapore mapped its citizen's life from birth to death – into 11 stages. When citizens gave birth, they also had to go to three different agencies for birth registration, apply for a baby bonus, and obtain a library card. However, the Singaporean government revamped the service, and now parents have to digitally apply once for a previous 3-stage application. **Ms. Lee** pointed out that this was all possible as the government redesigned the process by getting parents directly involved in the process through numerous interviews, observations, and feedback from the users.

**Ms. Lee** addressed the last question by introducing three major regulations and legislations for public service delivery:

- *No Wrong Door Policy:* The policy's objective is to help citizens unaware of which agency to approach for their needs and avoid situations where citizens feel they are being pushed from one agency to another. Suppose an agency receives public feedback not under its purview. In that case, the agency will act on behalf of the Feedback Provider (FP) to identify the responsible agency and ensure that the agency takes up the case before referring the FP to the correct agency. Through this policy, the government will be able to facilitate timely referral, coordination, and resolve public feedback at the whole-of-government level, even if citizens were misdirected or require coordination from more than one agency.
- *Digital Service Standards Policy:* The Digital Government Blueprint (DGB) is a statement of the Singaporean government's ambition to better leverage data, harness new technologies, and drive broader efforts to build a digital economy and digital society in support of a Smart Nation. Digital Service Standards (DSS) guide agencies to implement their digital services to meet the DGB goal of delivering digital services that are easy, seamless, and relevant for the citizens and businesses. All public-facing digital services of the government must meet the DSS. In addition, the Singaporean government conducts mystery-shopping checks based on the DSS to ensure that the digital services implemented consistently meet the desired outcomes of DGB.
- *Public Sector Governance Act:* The Personal Data Protection Act (PDPA) applies to the private sector. Two different legal frameworks governing data management in the public and private sectors are needed because the public has different expectations of the services provided by the government and the private sector. Under the act, the government is expected to deliver services in an integrated manner across agencies. This particular act seeks to enable all agencies to share data across different agencies. Hence, all data can be shipped from agency to agency with the exception of sensitive data (e.g., the citizen's salary). This Act will allow the government to govern data management in the public sector, including legal frameworks to facilitate data sharing to deliver services in an integrated manner across agencies.

Panelists from Azerbaijan and Vietnam were asked to respond to the following questions:

- How did you get funding for capital investment (ICT equipment installation, renovation, refurbishment, Mobile Buses, or other elements) for your one-stop-shop facilities and logistics at the national and local levels?
- What are the financial challenges, and how are you overcoming those challenges?
- How did you build up your ICT infrastructures, such as IT equipment maintenance and operation? Please elaborate on the operation of the ICT infrastructure.

**Mr. Abdul Aliyev**, Head, International Relations Department, The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan

**Mr. Abdul Aliyev** addressed the first question by mentioning that ASAN is a government initiative. Its funding originates directly from the government for all the necessities such as infrastructure, equipment, and high-tech supplies. As such, it is known that the Azerbaijani government allocates a special budget for this purpose.

• **Mr. Abdul** also pointed out that while ASAN's funding comes from the government, the government could pay back all its investment, as there was approximately a 30% excess amount from the initial investment itself. This is why the ASAN service is considered a successful project in financial terms.

The ASAN Service Centers are delivered on a fee basis. Each service has a certain amount of fee that is charged to the citizens. Those fees are then allocated, where approximately 50% goes to the state budget, and the remaining amount is used to support its employees. This system allows ASAN to pay its employees remuneration (an extra bonus for the salaries of the employees working at the ASAN Service Centers to motivate them financially). It is also noted that along with the public entities operating the Service Centers, there are also private organizations providing services. This allows ASAN to save up and invest in its new projects, innovations, and infrastructural matters with the fees originating from those alternative sources.

Mr. Abdul introduced three main challenges the ASAN Service Centers are currently experiencing:

- It is desirable for all citizens in each region to access ASAN. However, having a onestop-shop in each region is a financial challenge since buildings, equipment, and infrastructure are required. As such, the Azerbaijani government tries to focus more on having mobile buses and being more accessible via its online services by developing its My.Gov portals.
- The second challenge is limited finances for new initiatives and projects. The publicprivate partnerships serve as a solution to this challenge, as the government built relations with diverse international partners and donors in collaborating and financing new initiatives and projects.
- The last challenge that the Azerbaijani government faced was the difficulty in operating the Service Centers during the COVID-19 outbreak. Citizens were reluctant to visit the Service Centers, which negatively affected the Center's income. Hence, agile preparation against the pandemic and maintaining the work of the ASAN Service Centers by regulating the number of citizens visiting the centers were required. As a

result, ASAN Service Centers continued to operate during the lockdown period by rendering its citizens the most urgent and necessary services. Social distancing was maintained at the Service Centers through the online queuing system on the ASAN website and the ASAN mobile app. Moreover, the ASAN Call Centers operated as an information transmission center, where the Call Center also contributed to regulating the queue in the Service Centers.

**Mr. Abdul** reiterated the point on the Service Centers receiving financial support from the government, where the government also supports the Center's ICT infrastructure. Moreover, ASAN cooperates financially with private entities. Lastly, **Mr. Abdul** emphasized that ASAN has its own team of ICT experts who have been trained in foreign countries. This team was responsible for managing the Service Centers queue, which increased coherence and decreased coordination problems. **Mr. Abdul** concluded his speech by stating that promptness and flexibility are the most important factors in the ICT systems of any service center.

Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi, Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam

Since the provincial and district Public Administration Service Centers are deemed critical in providing services, due attention is paid to investment in soft and hard infrastructure, facilities, and equipment based on a combination of new construction and upgrading of existing facilities.

**Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi** highlighted that all investment resources for the system of equipment and facilities at the provincial and district OSSs are from the state budget, which the provincial and district governments reallocate.

- Up to now, 100% of OSS at communes, wards, and townships have invested in facilities and equipment. The surveillance camera system is connected from the Smart City Governance Center to the Provincial Public Administration Center and 13 local District Centers, and 177 OSSs at the commune level.
- Quang Ninh has allocated all implementation costs from the local budget, including human resources and maintenance costs, to ensure that the infrastructure is centralized, managed, and well-functioning.

Equipment and software serving provincial and district OSSs are important enablers of providing online services and developing e-Government.

- Quang Ninh has studied the best international practices to design its new OSS model and decided to adopt a centralized investment and management model to enhance the interoperability of ICT infrastructure.
- Quang Ninh invests in ICT hardware, infrastructure, and specialized equipment to conduct online public administrative transactions. It has a system of servers, computers, and networks equipped with 100% high-configuration computers for public servants, intranet, and internet connecting the Centers.
- Administrative procedures are handled on a computer system, making the administrative procedure settlement process transparent and consistent, simplifying the

process, shortening the time, and making it convenient for administrative procedures, organizations, and citizens.

The electronic software system is integrated across the provincial and district OSS and connects all departments, branches, divisions, and people's committees at the district level.

• A number of software is applied at the Center, including handling administrative procedures, citizen calling, work scheduling, obtaining ordinal numbers, returning results, collecting fees and charges, evaluating cadres and public servants, monitoring the software. The statistics on the settlement of administrative procedures are all integrated into the provincial and district OSSs.

However, it is noted that some challenges were present:

- Only 2% of the entire state budget being invested in provincial and district OSS serves as a challenge;
- Citizens do not have high internet literacy and internet accessibility; and
- Because Vietnam is currently undergoing the process of establishing a country database, it is not easy to enjoy the full effects and influence of the OSS model.

Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi was asked to respond to the following questions:

- Do the provincial government have extra funding for the OSS Center aside from the allocated 2% of the provincial budget?
- Please elaborate on how the benefits from the fees and charges are shared among the agencies who are housed in the OSS Center.

In response to the first question, **Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi** mentioned that the provincial governments apply for a project in the central government annually, if approved, serves as extra funding from the central government for the OSS model.

For the second question, **Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi** stated that provincial and state governments pay more income – about 100 USD for the staffs working at the OSS Center, which serves as motivation.

Panelists from Bangladesh and Singapore were asked to respond to the following questions:

- What measures has your country undertaken to overcome the digital divide?
- How did your country introduce digital transformation for OSS?
- What were the effective strategies for building partnerships with the ICT sector and the private sector for innovative solutions?

**Mr. Anir Chowdhury**, Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh

**Mr. Anir Chowdhury** introduced three different methods Bangladesh has undertaken to overcome the digital divide: physically, establishing a national portal, and setting up a call center.
- The Digital Bangladesh Vision (2008) embodies the government's efforts to provide efficient, citizen-centric public services to all, bridge the digital divide from the bottomup, and upholding the principle of leaving no one behind. This was officially when the Bangladeshi government started experimenting with the one-stop service centers. The OSS started from 2 locations as a pilot to about 4,500 locations nationwide in 2010. The number of OSS in Bangladesh currently amounts to more than 7,000 centers.
- In 2014, Bangladesh added the Virtual Postal Service Centers to the National Portal. However, in 2018, the Bangladeshi government understood that increasing access to the internet was crucial for citizens to access the national digital centers. Since then, the government has exerted effort to increase the then-low internet penetration. The current internet penetration amounts to 65%, where it started at 1% in 2008. Moreover, the government is also trying to increase smartphone penetration and has increased its 20% in 2018 to 35%.
- While discussing other forms where people can access public service, Bangladesh introduced the National Helpline (Triple Three) a call center. With its establishment, anybody with a phone can call the number 333 to request government information. Triple Three is also in the process of becoming a one-stop service center, with its additional features on land, healthcare, medicine, and e-commerce.
- The Bangladeshi government recently introduced another national portal called the MyGov portal, accessible by smartphones. The portal currently has about 500 services and is expected to host 1,500 services by the end of this year.

The Bangladeshi government introduced the digital transformation of OSS in three ways: Service Process Simplification (SPS), Digital Service Design Lab, and through its MyGov national portal.

- Through Service Process Simplification (SPS), the government was able to look through the citizens' lens. The government was able to identify the problems citizens face in accessing government services and was able to simplify those services by eliminating steps or merging multiple steps into one. It is noted that SPS is annually performed, in which there is an SPS methodology that every ministry follows to simplify services.
- Consequently, the Digital Service Design Lab was introduced, a combination of designthinking services for simplifying digital design and the training of government officials – particularly the non-technical government officials, in collaboration with the private sector. As a result, this initiative created ministry-ICT sector partnerships and introduced the simplification and digitization of 100 services across different ministries.
- The MyGov portal is currently working to bring all services into one place. Moreover, policy legos are contributing to its rapid digitization. Examples of policy legos are technology components that have been built over the past 12 years: citizen profiles, citizen national ID, and workflow or technologies.
- MyLocker allows document storage in the cloud and for different payments between the citizens and government G2C or C2G payments. Moreover, it ensures privacy in data sharing across different ministries and with the private sectors.

- Integrating service into the MyGov platform requires rapid digitization of services that allow for public services' digital transformation. Digital registries from different ministries such as land, education, healthcare, and social safety nets are being developed.
- For example, the government introduced e-Marketplaces or e-Commerce by collaborating with 20 different e-Commerce platforms. Additionally, e-Learning platforms have emerged. Hence, policy legos can introduce rapid digitization in the form of 50 services per month.

There were two effective partnerships with the ICT and private sectors for innovative solutions: citizen entrepreneurship and agent banking.

- *Citizen Entrepreneurship:* Digital centers run by citizen entrepreneurs and not salaried government employees are one way to build partnerships outside the government. These entrepreneurs ensure that each digital center is market-driven and sustainable, as they need to generate revenues. They are selected by locally elected representatives, local-level administrators, and central ministries and are evaluated yearly for their performance. They generate revenues to support themselves, and the government is not responsible for their wages.
- *Agent Banking:* This is another example where the existence of Digital Centers creates a win-win situation for the private sector and citizens alike. These centers deliver government services as well as private sector services such as banking services. The agent banking service allowed banks to establish remote branches without creating new establishments. By paying small fees to these entrepreneurs, the Digital Centers have become financially sustainable, where rural citizens can access the full service of retail banking at their doorsteps.

**Ms. Lee Mui Ling**, Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore

Singapore has taken three major measures to overcome the digital divide under its Digital Readiness Blueprint, which discusses digital access, literacy, and participation.

- *Digital Access:* **Ms. Lee Mui Ling** emphasized the importance of ensuring widespread access to basic digital enablers such as mobile devices, connectivity, bank accounts, and digital identity. Digital access is important, especially to three groups: the poor, the disabled, and the seniors. Moreover, local governments and organizations also have to be educated and encouraged to design their digital services to be inclusive for the diverse members of the public.
- *Digital Literacy:* The second is ensuring that the government has a program that upskills all citizens in a friendly way by providing dedicated and regular one-on-one concierge-type help and training. This is provided at the community centers, public libraries, and senior activity centers to impart basic digital skills. These programs may be held by the officers themselves, the retirees, or the volunteers. Moreover, Singapore is also developing government apps, websites, and services in the country's four official languages to reach out to the elderly who do not speak English.

• *Digital Participation:* Lastly, digital participation is also termed as "Additional 101," in which citizens learn to spell out a set of basic digital skills for everyday activities. Some examples are searching for information on the web, making cashless payments, and using messaging and digital government services. It is also noted that Singaporean businesses are strongly encouraged to provide digital literacy training to employees and customers.

Consequently, **Ms. Lee** discussed the building blocks of the Digital Participation Program, particularly dedicated to senior citizens.

- Seniors Go Digital: It is a national movement to accelerate digital adoption in the community and equip every individual with digital tools and skills. There is a related program called the "Hawkers Go Digital." The Singaporean government is encouraging these food vendors to adopt a cashless payment scheme so that the citizens themselves will be encouraged to go cashless. Hence, the hawkers are given a unique QR code, and the government supports the transaction fees.
- *Digital Ambassadors:* Staff and volunteers are recruited to reach out to seniors in community centers and public libraries to raise their digital skills. The digital ambassadors also educate the hawkers on digitization.
- *Digital Access Programme:* The programme aims to equip low-income households, students, and persons with disabilities with digital tools for them to get connected and be empowered by technology. These citizens can simply sign up, and the government will pay for their broadband and smartphone plans. Moreover, students have a choice of receiving subsidized rates on either their laptops or desktops, which includes free Wifi for three years and warrantee.
- *Mobile Access for Seniors:* It is a scheme that provides subsidized smartphones and mobile plans to lower-income seniors who want to go digital but cannot afford them.

In response to the second question, **Ms. Lee** mentioned the Singaporean government's vision of achieving a future state where citizens can interact with the government. She introduced how the Singaporean government started with the citizens in mind by conducting several focus groups. As a result, the government discovered the following:

- First, the Singaporean citizens wished the government knew them intimately by gathering all their data from the relevant agencies
- Second, the citizens wanted the government to anticipate their needs beforehand, for them not having to approach public services aside for the event of the transaction
- Lastly, the citizens expected the government to connect and act as one government body, not several disparate ones

From the information gathered, the establishment of a whole-of-government Omni-channel Service Delivery System to deliver integrated services digitally and physically besides its onestop-shop was introduced. The Omni-channel Service Delivery has the following characteristics:

- *Digital Channel:* The Digital Channel puts together all the services across different agencies in a coherent manner for the citizen's life stages from life to death.
- *Contact Center:* While citizens will reach out to the Contact Center if the Digital Channel is inaccessible, **Ms. Lee** illustrated one example that Singapore experienced during the COVID-19 pandemic. The government realized that citizens tend to call in with one separate question. Hence, the government encouraged the Contact Center agents to conduct cross-referrals so that when citizens call in, they can obtain information on employment, tax deferment, rent payment, housing loans, and more in one call.
- *Physical Channel:* The cross-referrals also apply in the Physical Channels so that staff can offer more services to the visiting citizens in one go.

**Ms. Lee** addressed the last question by introducing two strategies the Singaporean government is implementing to build partnerships with the ICT and private sectors: the Co-development Partners Model and the Talent Attachment Programme.

- *Co-development Partners:* A public-private partnership model is adopted, where private sector players are seen as collaborators and partners in co-creating better experiences rather than simple vendors to the government. For instance, government tech stacks are extended to SingPass/MyInfo (a unique and authentic technology and citizens' data aggregator platform) to the private sector, such as banks, to make banking services seamless.
- *Talent Attachment Programme:* The programme allows public servants who are identified as high-potentials to learn from leading innovative companies in the private sector. They are provided opportunities to collaborate with the private sector for 6-12 months to learn about service analytics, customer experience, digital design, and management. Some partner institutions include the banks (United Overseas Bank Limited and DBS Bank), Razer (the equivalent of Uber), Lazada, Shoppee, and Pebbleroad. The next batch is expected to be sent to Dyson, PayPal, DHL, Spotify, and more. The public servants are involved in the roles or projects that expose them to their innovative practices and culture.

### **5.7 Session 4: Effective National to Local Governance**

#### Moderator: Mr. Sanva Saephan, Consultant, DPIDG/UN DESA

Panelists from Azerbaijan and Vietnam were asked to respond to the following questions:

- What are some examples of effective strategies and innovative practices you have utilized in your country for coordination from the national to local level to enhance public service delivery? What challenges did you face, how did you overcome them, and what are the lessons learned?
- What are some of the measures and strategies for breaking silos and fostering effective coordination and policy coherence across different agencies of local governments, particularly back offices?

**Mr. Ruslan Akbarov**, Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan

**Mr. Ruslan Akbarov** addressed the questions by first introducing the Azerbaijani Service and Assessment Network (ASAN) launched under the Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan No. 685 on June 2012. ASAN was established to enhance the efficiency and quality of the country's administrative services by adopting an e-service model that brought all such services into a one-stop-shop. Some of its objectives include:

- To reduce extra expenses and loss of time by citizens;
- To strengthen confidence towards the state structures; and
- To increase transparency and strengthen the fight against corruption.

The transition of administrative processes to e-services, ensuring that ethical rules and civilized behavior towards citizens followed, providing more comfortable and cost-efficient services, and utilizing modern innovations were possible because state entities are rendering ASAN's employment services. As a result, there are 12 government organizations in one ASAN service center, and more than 320 services were delivered to its users.

During the establishment, the coordination between relevant state agencies, monitoring systems, and better methods to deliver services were considered. To better deliver services and to increase citizens' accessibility, the services were made available online. Consequently, citizens could also visit the service centers in the capital, Baku, and other cities or access the mobile offices that traveled throughout the country.

Another goal of establishing the ASAN Service Center was to ensure that ethical rules and civilized behaviors were followed when addressing the Azerbaijani citizens. To assure this, representatives from private sectors were assigned at the Centers to provide special training for the state entities. Courses on ethics, developing schemes, business management, and listening and explaining skills for effective public service delivery were offered. Additionally, ASAN started operating feedback systems through the quarterly 'Citizen Satisfaction Survey' to improve service quality and meet citizens' needs. ASAN also analyzes the key cases, problems in service, and documentation and continuously monitors and evaluates the services provided by government agencies.

**Mr. Akbarov** pointed out that avoiding conflicts of interest turned out to be a challenge. To avoid conflicts of interest in ASAN, ASAN needed to render all the services and have different organizations representing and delivering their services. Moreover, to avoid corruption, special standards and minimum specifications were provided for each center to follow. The anti-corruption element was addressed by redefining relations between state agencies and citizens, eradicating or minimizing direct contact between them, enhancing transparency, and eliminating opportunities for corruption.

Mr. Ngheim Son, speaking on behalf of Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi, Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam

**Mr. Ngheim Son** responded to the questions by emphasizing that the Vietnamese government has supported the development of e-government to modernize public administration and foster public service delivery and citizen access, particularly during the COVID-19 outbreak.

In December 2019, the Vietnamese government launched the National Public Service Portal (NPSP) to enable centralized access for its citizens. Quang Ninh is one of the three localities in the country to connect its Provincial Public Service Portal to the NPSP since November 2019.

- Quang Ninh province's centralized online public service delivery system has been officially built and provided to people and businesses since 1 July 2016, at the e-portal: "dichvucong.quangninh.gov.vn." Quang Ninh province has assigned tasks to organize the connection and integration of the province's online services, the e-government system of the province on the NPSP.
- Currently, 100% of the administrative procedures of Quang Ninh province provided on the Provincial Public Service Portal have been standardized and simplified, and a clear implementation process has been developed according to the prescribed standards. The process of connecting to the NPSP is very convenient for administrative procedures that are used in all communes, wards, and townships, with the "issuing birth certificates" procedure being one of the examples.

Since its implementation, Quang Ninh province has integrated 1,200 out of 1,871 online public services on the NPSP, and it is the province with one of the highest number of integrations and interconnections, ranking second nationwide.

- The number of online submissions from the NPSP to Quang Ninh is over 12,000, with an average of 1,000 applications per month.
- There are 1,500 different people and business accounts created on the NPSP.

Quang Ninh also has standardized and publicized administrative procedures on the National Database of Administrative Procedures. It serves as a platform to receive and process complaints from people and businesses on the NPSP and receives and processes online applications sent from the NPSP.

However, the implementation process encountered some difficulties as follows:

• Some ministries and agencies are still slow in updating their decisions on announcing administrative procedures in the database. This affects the process of standardizing the

administrative data for the province, which leads to difficulties in publicizing the services on the National Database, integrating, and providing administrative services on the National Portal.

• The receipt and handling of complaints and petitions still face many difficulties because there is no specific guidance on the National Portal. There are complaints and petitions received that are not within the handling competency of the People's Committee of Quang Ninh province and must be returned to the managing agency. Therefore, Quang Ninh also proposed to the Government Office to update specific instructions on receiving and handling complaints and petitions of people and businesses on the National Portal.

In general, the connection of the Provincial Public Service Portal with the National Public Service Portal has helped people and businesses to settle administrative procedures anytime and anywhere. People can look up the process of handling documents through the individual identification number and receive the results through the online public service delivery.

Panelists from Bangladesh and Singapore were asked to respond to the following questions:

- Are there endorsed coordination and consultation mechanisms in place so that the priorities of sub-national government entities operating ODSCs are systematically integrated into national policy/strategy formulation and planning processes?
- Do ODSCs take action and follow up on the feedback they receive from users? If yes, how is this documented and shared with the public?

**Mr. Anir Chowdhury**, Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh

Addressing the first question, **Mr. Anir Chowdhury** introduced the Bangladeshi government's case of converting analog birth and death registration systems into a digitized process.

- Bangladesh's birth and death registration systems were an analog process until 2004, since its introduction in 1873. As a result, the country was only able to register about 8% of its population over the course of 131 years.
- When the digital process and the concept of a one-stop service center were introduced, the country could register about 95% of its population over 13 years, leading to a 110 times efficiency increase.

In addition, **Mr. Chowdhury** mentioned that the current trend in Bangladeshi ministries is taking local knowledge into national policy as part of the consultation process. The first case is of the local government ministry, as most of the digital centers are hosted by the local government institutions in the urban and rural areas.

- The local government ministry has developed a policy framework to establish a digital center, and it is currently developing a monitoring and evaluation system.
- Consequently, the ICT policy was developed in 2009 (later revised in 2015). In 2018, decentralization of service delivery through the one-stop service centers for every

ministry was encouraged. Hence, the ICT policy has been an enabler of digitization and decentralization to the digital centers.

- The Cabinet Division monitors the inclusion of the services into the one-stop service centers. Moreover, the district and sub-district administrators are monitoring the performance of these centers.
- In addition to the National Portal, the my.Gov portal is a recent addition in Bangladesh during the COVID-19 pandemic.
- Bangladesh has a Digital Bangladesh Task Force, and it is guiding the expansion of digital centers, monitors it, and issues policies.
- Bangladesh is currently working on an e-Governance Act, a law that will directly focus on the one-stop service centers, the service's process, and the simplification and decentralization of the service delivery. The law is currently being drafted and is expected to pass in the next few months.

**Mr. Chowdhury** mentioned two factors in the Bangladeshi ODSC feedback system. One is the periodic citizen surveys on the Digital Centers, where feedback on their needs is compiled for the staff to address any complaints or grievances they may have.

• It is noted that the Digital Centers have undergone third-party evaluation from Transparency International. An evaluation was conducted on how transparency and accountability have increased with the introduction of digitization and the one-stop service centers.

Second, the Grievance Redress System was introduced last year. Through it is in its early stage, its use has been expanded to the Digital Centers.

- Under the system, citizens register their grievances through the 333 IVR System. A citizen can simply call in and rate the services on a scale of 1-5. The feedback will be analyzed, and actions will be taken to redress the grievances by the respective ministries to improve service delivery. The system is expected to expand to all services and will be available at the one-stop service centers.
- A social media page primary Facebook is also available for all the local level administrators. All the 64 districts and 492 sub-districts have a grievance feature on their Facebook pages for citizens to access freely.

**Ms. Lee Mui Ling**, Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore

**Ms. Lee Mui Ling** described two coordination and consultation mechanisms. One is the Service Delivery Committee, which was renamed as the Service Council. It is a committee formed to drive the whole-of-government service delivery transformation initiatives as part of the Public Sector Transformation. The Service Council comprises chief executives – the senior leaders from agencies at the forefront of service delivery.

The Committee meets regularly quarterly to discuss changes in the operating model, how the physical service center can be expanded, and allows agencies and decision-makers to discuss proposals before they are approved and implemented throughout the Public Service.

Second, for policy reviews and sharing of best practices and learnings, **Ms. Lee** pointed out that the Singaporean government consults quarterly with the Quality Service Managers (QSMs), which are public agencies appointed from the senior management ranks to drive a culture of service excellence and change. They are also at the director level, and regular engagement forums are held to engage QSMs in discussing service delivery matters pertaining to the development and promotion of effective service management and practice across the Public Service.

In response to the second question, **Ms. Lee** illustrated the ODSC feedback mechanism with an example of improving the video conferencing experience at the Integrated Public Service Center.

- With COVID-19, the Public Service Center had to close some of its frontline counters and pivoted to video conferencing with the staff. However, as they rolled into video conferencing, the staff noticed a couple of challenges.
- The video conference screen was too small that the vulnerable and poor who used old smartphones were unsure how to start the session. There were also many steps for citizens to follow to start a session, and most had trouble remembering the coded password.
- Consequently, the Service Center installed larger video screens, discarded the password to start a session, and the Center installed a one-press system to start the session with an easier user interface.

**Ms. Lee** pointed out that the service revamp was the result of the Service Center **walking the citizen's journey** – observing what citizens went through in the Center from start to finish, detecting what citizens did and how they reacted, **interviewing the citizens** and asking them to share their experience after the transaction – how they felt and what needed to be improved, and lastly, they **tracked the feedback rating** that was installed in the Service Center to gather citizen feedback after every transaction.

# **5.8 Session 5: Monitoring, Reporting, and Evaluation**

Moderator - Mr. Prabin Maharjan, Programme Management Expert, UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA

Panelists were asked to respond to the following questions:

- How did you define the monitoring and evaluation framework, including Key Performance Indicators: what does success mean?
- How is user feedback collected, and how is a service culture promoted?
- How did you communicate the progress to the citizens, lawmakers, and political leaders to continuously get their support?

**Ms. Junny Kim**, Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea

Answering the first question, Ms. Junny Kim defines the success of one-stop service with quantitative indicators and qualitative indicators. The quantitative indicators include how long it takes from application to issuance, how many services are treated in a month / a year, and performance comparison between similar ODSC. Citizens' satisfaction and evaluation (grade/score) and proposals of streamlining process/suggestions of a paperless workflow are qualitative indicators.

Ms. Junny Kim highlighted the user feedback collection and culture promotion. The Korean government uses a third-party organization to survey and evaluate our services to collect citizens' feedback and promote service culture. This independent party will then provide the government with a detailed report recommending the strategies to overcome the challenges to enhance service delivery. Changing and promoting a service culture is bound to take considerable time. But incentivizing and training officials consistently can lead to a good outcome. A campaign for good service can be established through customized service and a kind service attitude.

The government needs to listen to the opinions of citizens, lawmakers, and politicians. For instance, lawmakers can provide positive and negative criticism of the policy to improve public service delivery. They need to keep monitoring policies that affect the citizens' safety and comfort of life because citizens are voting power. To communicate with the citizens widely, the Korean Government makes full use of the online portal where citizens can submit their suggestions and propose new policies at any time. The government can also use social media and press releases to announce and spread the policy to the public and gain support. User-friendly services and customized services are also useful for communicating progress to the citizens, lawmakers, and political leaders to get their support continuously.

Two other panelists, **Mr. Ruslan Akbarov** from Azerbaijan and **Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi** from Vietnam, were asked to respond to the following question:

• Could you please explain the monitoring and reporting mechanisms deployed by the one-stop-shop coordinating institution in your country?

**Mr. Ruslan Akbarov,** Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan

In response to the question, Mr. Ruslan Akbarov mentioned that the State Agency has a specific monitoring and assessment department consisting of several divisions such as monitoring, assessment, and mobile service divisions. The situation center is also used as a means of monitoring the service area. The monitoring and assessment divisions are responsible for applying services carried out by different state organizations on a correlative basis and applying the single window principle. One direction of the monitoring and assessment is a provision of public services in accordance with the legislation to oversee the application of a service provided in the centers in line with the principles of efficiency, transparency, courtesy, responsibility, and accountability. Another direction of monitoring assessment is the provision of mobile service centers.

The State Agency uses different means to monitor the service area and ensure the call to service. For instance, it monitors the professionalism of the staff and the service level, such as

- Obedience to established principles, rules, by the centers, lending of service in accordance with the law. All the services should be rendered according to the legislation, how it is written, the processing period, and the service delivery.
- Corruption offenses and compliance with the rules of ethical behavior by employees at the service centers.

A monitoring assessment department is a structural unit of the state agency, which means that the state agency also controls the service centers through direct and general monitoring. Direct monitoring is conducted by the staff members of the ASAN service center's service process. The general monitoring is conducted by service providers' supervisors of their management department. Supervisors are responsible for one or more than one or a couple of service centers, from citizens' location to complaints from the services or suggestions for services simplifications. To avoid subjectivity, the State Agency uses the rotation system where supervisors are rotated regularly. This reduces subjectivity and ensures uniform management of the service centers.

The State Agency uses the maximum means to get feedback from citizens such as electronic devices, call centers, and mobile applications of ASAN, online chatting on websites. It also established the complaint management and suggestions journal at the ASAN Service Center, where the citizens' complaints, suggestions, or feedback are stored and analyzed to get maximum information about the current situation at the centers' situation of the service rendering process. For assessment, the State Agency applies point systems. The point system is acquired for motivational purposes and to avoid offenses.

Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi, Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam

On behalf of Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi, Mr. Nghiem Son shared the monitoring and reporting mechanism to deploy the one-stop-shop, including Key Performance Indicators. The entire administrative procedure settlement activities of the Provincial and District OSSs and the modern "receiving and returning units" OSSs are monitored through the electronic one-stop-shop software system. All administrative dispute settlement records are digitized to update the system and closely monitor the settlement progress. At the same time, it is possible to monitor staff interactions with users through the camera system located at Provincial centers, synchronously connected to the Smart City Governance Center of the province.

In addition, officials can cross-supervise each other in resolving issues to promptly remind one another and proactively adjust practices through effective communication. The division and staff in charge are also subject to the supervision of organizations and citizens through evaluation sheets so that the management agency can promptly monitor problems and bottlenecks.

The evaluation of public servants appointed to work at the Center every year is organized by the Center's Director and the heads of agencies and units in accordance with the relevant regulations, guided by the following criteria, among others: specific assessment such as the observance of administrative discipline, civilized culture in the office; communication attitude, dealing with citizens; the quality of receiving, guiding and handling administrative procedures; the number of survey questionnaires to assess the satisfaction of organizations and citizens. On a weekly, monthly, and quarterly basis, the Provincial Public Administration Service Center and District-level public administration service centers shall summarize and report data on administrative procedure and settlement data are also updated in real-time on the electronic One-Stop-shop system, the online public service system for organizations and citizens to capture and monitor together.

## **5.9** Lessons Learned from the Implementation of OSS for Service Delivery

**Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev,** Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, shared four key lessons:

- 1. **Don't think that building infrastructure and starting operation is enough:** Always manage your business processes in detail.
- 2. **Don't underestimate the power of coordination:** Coordinate through different levels between the employees and agencies operating at your centers.
- 3. Don't ever neglect the importance of innovations and new solutions reflected in the legislation: Always prepare the new updates regarding the work of One-Stop Shops as the world of service delivery changes day by day.
- 4. **Don't overload the employees:** Smile on their faces is key to effective public service delivery.

**Mr. Anir Chowdhury**, Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh, shared three key lessons:

- 1. **Change-makers within the government:** If the right government stakeholders can be appropriately mobilized, it is possible to bring about positive changes within the government. Development agencies are at times too focused on policy advocacy from the outside. There are times when objectives can be accomplished more sustainably by catalyzing improvements and innovations from within. However, that requires developing a guiding coalition of change-makers within the government ministries and agencies.
- 2. **Re-engineer, simplify, decentralize:** The sustainability of many socially important services ultimately relies on institutions closest to the people, especially the underserved. So, it is critical to empower them and re-engineer, simplify, decentralize service delivery to make them accessible from there. The innovative use of ICTs can play an empowering role in such endeavors.
- 3. **Don't attempt to do everything at once:** At the preliminary stages, the initiative needs to focus on securing existential factors things that are critical to the long-term sustainability of the gains made. So, it needs to prioritize, make progress in phases, and remain opportunistic and ready to embrace uncertainty.

Key lessons shared by **Ms. Junny Kim**, Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea:

1. Long-term planning of investment, annual practicing strategies, driving / evaluating/correcting: Prepare a long-term investment plan and consistently evaluate it and correct your plan. The financial investment is very important because we put 100 million dollars every year for digital governance, resulting in convenient one-stop services.

- 2. **Prioritize services and select one-stop-shop** / **Allocate financial and technical resources:** Prioritize the most essential and necessary services for local residents. All services cannot be provided by one stop, and we should select the services possible for the government to collaborate. This, in turn, helps the government allocate the financial and technical resources to the services most needed.
- 3. Coordination and planning at the national level/implementation and feedback at the local level: Do not only coordinate and plan at the national level but also implement at the local level concretely and keep gathering their feedbacks consistently.
- 4. **Don't follow other cases identically / modification and adaptation are essential to make own one-stop shop:** Do not copy other cases because every country has different circumstances and practices. We all have different legal systems, political governance, and financial capacities. Therefore, modification and adaptation are essential to make your one-stop service.

**Ms. Lee Mui Ling**, Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation, of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore, shared the following key lessons:

- 1. **Integrate, Not just Coordinate**: We want to achieve service integration, not just add a layer to coordinate services. Therefore, agencies need to come together to redesign the approach, processes, and systems to know, anticipate, and serve citizens as one entity.
- 2. **Start Small, Think Big:** We do not propose a "big bang" launch of a one-stop-shop. Instead, stage the process, start with smaller-scale pilots to prove the concept, and then work towards scaling the model after the successful pilots.
- 3. **The People**: We need to recruit people with the right mindset and service DNA. In addition, they need to be trained and compensated based on the new integrated service model.

**Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi**, Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam, shared the following key lessons:

- 1. Shorten the processes and times to handle administrative procedures
- 2. Improve transparency in administrative procedures
- 3. Invest in facilities, technical infrastructure, working equipment synchronously with high efficiency
- 4. Manage public servants effectively
- 5. Increase the trust of citizens in state administrative apparatus

## **5.10 Closing Remarks**

**H.E. Mr. Thongchan Manixay,** in his closing remarks, thanked UN DESA, UNDP, UN RCO, and colleagues from MOHA, POHA, and NGAPR for working tirelessly to put the Workshop together. He noted that the lesson shared by the panelists would inspire ODSCs in Lao PDR to continue to improve their respective ODSCs to provide effective and transparent public services to citizens. He reiterated that improving public service delivery had always been one of the government's top priorities of Lao PDR, and this priority was also embedded in the 9th National Socio-Economic Development Plan (2021 - 2025).

Mr. Manixay expressed his hope that the Workshop's output could inform the future follow-up workshop and inter-ministerial Workshop to discuss how the Government of Lao PDR could bring ODSCs to the next level so that citizens could access public services most effectively and transparently. He echoed that coordination and commitment from concerned ministries were crucial to the success of ODSCs, without which there was only how much MOHA could do.

**Mr. Bokyun Shim**, Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA, underscored that the international Workshop had provided the participants with an overview of the key opportunities and challenges on promoting effective One-Door-Service Centers for integrated service delivery. Citizens everywhere counted on governments to provide high-quality, reliable, responsive to their needs, and affordable services. Citizens today were more aware of their rights to access information about public services and had higher expectations of both the services and the user experience. They were increasingly demanding the same levels of service delivery they were accustomed to getting in the private sector. Voice of the citizen research was critical in understanding user awareness, needs, expectations, and preferences.

Understanding a department's or agency's citizen base was a prerequisite in delivering services to meet their needs in the way they wanted them delivered. Bringing people to the core of public service delivery should be the top priority. A citizen-centric approach started with citizens' journey. Engaging and having citizens participate in designing a One-Stop-Shop through survey and focus group enabled citizen ideas and perspectives to be included in a citizen-centric service delivery model. Involving citizens in the design and delivery of public services by engaging in the voice of the customer research sent a strong, proactive message that their views and opinions mattered and had been found to engender trust and confidence in government.

Mr. Shim highlighted the mechanism to ensure bringing people to the core of public service delivery. Mr. Shim also emphasized the need to streamline and re-engineer the public delivery process.

- It could be ensured by introducing the mechanism of the three steps, which are "Walk the citizen's journey," "interview the citizen," and "track feedback rating" as implemented in Singapore.
- Also, the service quality problems could be solved by training the employees continuously, offering financial incentives to related employees, and monthly employee evaluation.
- And developing the basic rules and standards for processing one-stop services, providing prizes, expanding divisions, increasing the number of public servants,

providing manuals, monitoring the process, and conducting surveys on the people's satisfaction.

DPIDG/UN DESA, together with its partners, was committed to promoting and supporting the government of Lao PDR's capacity development through demand-driven and solutions-driven partnerships. UNDESA would continue to promote knowledge transfer through peer-to-peer learning and support innovation in public service delivery by collecting and disseminating good practices.

# 6. National Workshop on Lessons Learned and Next Steps in Implementing the ODSCs in Lao PDR

## 6.1 Opening

On behalf of Deputy **Minister Nisith Keopanya**, who could not attend the Workshop as he had to attend the extraordinary session of the National Assembly, **Mr. Singthavone Dalavong**, Head of MOHA Cabinet, expressed his gratitude to UN DESA for supporting the Workshop. He mentioned that all the comments and insightful discussions arising from the Workshop would be reported to Deputy Minister Nisith Keopanya and his colleagues for further discussions.

**Mr. Sean O'Connell**, Head of Governance, UNDP Lao PDR, emphasized the need to set the stage for taking the important lessons and putting them into practice in Lao PDR. He stressed that no system could be replicated completely in Lao PDR. The ODSCs needed to unpack some of the key lessons, learnings, and key principles and to make them fit in the Lao PDR context. He highlighted three key lessons: (1) importance of planning and strategy at the central and local level; (ii) importance of feedback from citizens and the provincial and local authorities to reform the practices and to improve our practices; and (iii) importance of changing mindsets and commitment to focusing on people, streamlining processes, and efficiency.

**Mr. Bokyun Shim**, Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA, briefly mentioned the key takeaways from the morning session: (1) Uncovered common challenges and roadblocks to the implementation of your ODSCs; (2) Enhanced awareness of the various approaches and methodologies adopted by different countries to overcome some of the challenges in implementing ODSCs; (3) Identified the key building blocks in reforming their ODSCs and (4) Established plans for follow-up mechanisms for further peer-to-peer learning. In addition, Mr. Shim emphasized the importance of the national Workshop as a platform to provide an opportunity for the ODSCs to (1) Enhance knowledge of the building blocks needed to effectively implement the ODCS and how they apply to their national circumstances; (2) Enhance understanding of the need for vertical coordination and horizontal coordination; (3) Increase awareness of the capacities needed for effective ODCSs; and (4) Establish follow-up actions.

## 6.2 Debriefing about the International Presentations and Discussions during the Morning Segment

**Mr. Keping Yao,** Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert of UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA summarized all the key findings from the International Workshop to share with the ODSCs in Lao PDR. The ODSCs in Lao PDR appreciated that Mr. Yao succinctly summarized all the key points to share with them.

Session 1: Criti	Session 1: Critical Role of Leadership for Effective One-Door-Service Centers	
Azerbaijan	<ul> <li>Direct support from the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan in establishing a unique Azerbaijani model of one-stop-shop centers for service delivery</li> </ul>	
	Concrete legislative acts	

Session 1: Critical Role of Leadership for Effective One-Door-Service Centers	
	• The introduction of the ASAN Service Index and transition to the digital government portal
Republic of Korea	• MOIS as the leading agency to advance digital government development
Singapore	• Vision - One stop, one step with citizens at the center.
Bangladesh	• Housing the a2i Programme in the Prime Minister's Office.
Vietnam	<ul> <li>Public administration reform since the 1990s and continued to place it within the priority of improving service delivery and good governance in the upcoming 2021-2030 development strategy</li> <li>In March 2021, Vietnam Prime Minister issued Decision 468 on Revamping the One-Stop Shops (OSS) model to enable citizencentered service delivery, further digitalize and utilize data collected at the OSS and improve administration efficiency</li> <li>Quang Ninh province (Vietnam) secured approval from the competent central agencies to implement the "Provincial Public Administration Service Center and District-level public administration service centers" project.</li> </ul>

Session 2: Insti	tutional Coordination
Azerbaijan	• Effective PR campaign and establishment of ASAN Radio
Bangladesh	<ul> <li>Housing the a2i Programme in the Prime Minister's Office</li> <li>Forming the 'Coordination and Reforms Unit' in the Cabinet Office with a Secretary at its helm, the reforms facilitated by the ICT Ministry and Ministry of Public Administration</li> <li>Partnering with the Local Government Ministry to locate the Digital Centers.</li> </ul>
Republic of Korea	<ul> <li>MOIS has the law and regulations, incentives, and inspecting authority</li> <li>Local governments are flexible to manage and operate the one-stop system</li> <li>Digital automation of service provision</li> <li>Information sharing system.</li> </ul>
Singapore	• Agencies come together to deliver seamless, anticipatory, and personalized services for citizens. Transforming service delivery to

Session 2: Insti	tutional Coordination
	citizens through an omni-channel model that includes a digital platform, a unified call center, and physical one-stop centers
	<ul><li>Service Delivery Committee</li><li>Quarterly engagements with Quality Service Managers</li></ul>
Vietnam	• The Provincial People's Committee has promulgated the regulation on coordination of activities between the PPASC and relevant agencies, which act as the basis for the coordination role.

	ctural Organization, Processes, Digitization, and Financing of One-
Stop Shops	
Azerbaijan	<ul> <li>Funding from the government for infrastructure and installation of equipment</li> <li>Effective PR campaign and establishment of ASAN Radio</li> </ul>
Bangladesh	<ul> <li>Incorporating the 'Digital Bangladesh Vision 2021' into national planning to drive inclusive, pro-poor, and sustainable digitization</li> <li>Establishing digital centers</li> <li>Introducing the national helpline</li> </ul>
Republic of Korea	<ul> <li>Master plan of national e-government promotion</li> <li>Computerization of public administration: work efficiency and productivity</li> <li>Electric documentation and e-approval / e-reporting workflow system</li> <li>Paperless and re-engineering process</li> <li>MOIS has the law and regulations, incentives, and inspecting authority</li> <li>Local governments are flexible to manage and operate the one-stop system</li> <li>Digital automation of service provision</li> <li>Information sharing system</li> </ul>
Singapore	<ul> <li>The "Service Journey" Approach of Transforming Citizens' Experiences:</li> <li>Citizen-centric approach</li> </ul>

Session 3: Stru Stop Shops	ctural Organization, Processes, Digitization, and Financing of One-
	Service transformation within and across agencies
	Review policies & streamline frontline and backend processes
	<ul><li>Co-create with people and private sectors</li></ul>
	• Digital service standard; Public Sector Governance Act; and no wrong door policy

Session 4: Effective National to Local Governance	
Azerbaijan	• Coordination of government agencies and private companies based on the "one-stop-shop" principle.
Bangladesh	<ul> <li>Local government divisions established the policy frameworks needed to set up digital centers and establish the terms and condition</li> <li>District administration and Upazila (i.e., subdistrict) administrations monitor these centers and evaluate the entrepreneurs who run them</li> <li>Cabinet division strongly encourages scores of government agencies to use the digital centers as last-mile delivery points for hundreds of public services.</li> </ul>

Session 5: Mon	Session 5: Monitoring, Reporting, and Evaluation	
Azerbaijan	<ul> <li>Coordination and management of services to be rendered</li> <li>Trainings</li> </ul>	
Bangladesh	<ul> <li>Surveys: After a specific time period, citizens surveys are conducted in the Digital Centers for understanding citizens need and addressing their complaints</li> <li>Introducing grievance redress system</li> </ul>	
Republic of Korea	<ul> <li>Quantitative indicators</li> <li>Qualitative indicators</li> <li>User feedback and promote the service culture</li> </ul>	

Lessons Learne	Lessons Learned from the Implementation of One-Stop-Shops for Service Delivery	
Azerbaijan	<ul> <li>Proper management and re-engineering of business process</li> <li>Sustainability – political will, financial investment</li> </ul>	

Lessons Learne	ed from the Implementation of One-Stop-Shops for Service Delivery
	Coordination
	• Legislation should be updated
	Service excellency assessment
	• Do not overload employees to ensure motivation
Bangladesh	Change-makers within the government
	• Re-engineer, simplify, decentralize
	• Don't attempt to do everything at once
Republic of Korea	• Long-term planning of investment, annual practicing strategies, driving/evaluating/correcting
	• Prioritize services and select for one-stop-shop / allocate financial and technical resources
	• Coordination and planning at the national level/implementation and feedback at the local level
	• Modification and adaptation are essential to make own one-stop shop
Singapore	• Integrate, Not just Coordinate; Start Small, Think Big; recruit people with the right mindset and service DNA
	• In addition, they need to be trained and compensated based on the new integrated service model.

# **6.3 Presentations of Checklist for Effective ODSCs**

**Mr. Aslam Alam,** Chairman, and Executive Director, Bangladesh Institute for Information Literacy and Sustainable Development, Bangladesh, highlighted the nine building blocks for readiness assessment on institutional arrangements for policy coherence to implement the Agenda 2030 for Sustainable Development, developed by the UN DESA, that could be utilized for the design and implementation of the ODSCs for effective, inclusive and accountable public service delivery. The nine-building blocks were (1) Political commitment, (2) Transformational leadership, human resources and changing mindsets, (3) System thinking and policy linkages, (4) Organizational structures and processes, (5) Financing, (6) Digital Technology and data, (7) Coherence between national and regional/local level, (8) Stakeholders' engagement, (9) Monitoring, reporting and evaluation.

UN DESA had developed questionnaires on these building blocks to assess institutional readiness for the successful operation of the ODSC system. The checklist could be applied to both system and organizational levels. System-level refers to national or federal government

level and or state or provincial level governments. Local government bodies as a whole could be a system as well. The organization refers to a ministry, department, agency, and local government body. These questionnaires could be utilized as a self-assessment tool or assisted assessment tool, which an individual or a group could exercise. The checklist could be used as per the scope for adaptation and prioritization of the country.

## 6.4 Overview Presentation of the Digital Government Capability Assessment

**Mr. Keping Yao,** Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert of UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA provided an overview of the Digital Government Capability Assessment (DGCA)<sup>7</sup>, developed by UN DESA. DGCA aims to help identify institutional gaps and policy entry points in innovation and public service delivery. It could help produce new insights for defining options and making decisions on strategies and actions to transform government and create public value. The focus is not on a particular digital initiative, such as a portal, but rather on the whole of government capability needed for advancing digital government.

The DGCA is constructed around six dimensions which are important in evaluating the capacity for digital transformation. Each is an "enabler" of change or improved performance in a specific domain within a digital transformation framework.

- 1) **Leadership**: As stewards of digital transformation efforts, leaders have to craft the plans to achieve the organizational goals, engage, motivate, build commitment, communicate, mobilize resources and monitor progress for the successful implementation of a digital strategy.
- 2) **Strategy:** Strategic plans are the basis for designing the transformation agenda and delivering the digital transformation goals set by the government.
- 3) **Governance:** The organizational capacity and managerial actions developed to overcome potential cultural barriers in implementing the digital strategy across agencies and departments.
- 4) **Legal:** The set of legislation, guidelines, and standards that a department or agency must comply with in deploying digital services.
- 5) **Technology:** The set of technologies, directly and indirectly, contributes to delivering programs and services through digital platforms.
- 6) Workforce and Professional Development: The policy and programmatic actions in place to support ongoing capacity building.

Considering that digital government requires a multifaceted response from governments, the dimensions of the DGCA contain various statements which could guide governments in understanding gaps and policy entry points.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See <u>https://unpan.un.org/capacity-development/otc/self-assessment-tools/digital-government-capability-assessment</u> (last accessed on September 28, 2021).

## 6.5 Highlights of Digital Government Transformation in Lao

**Mr. Debashis Nag,** Regional Digital Transformation Consultant, UNDP Bangkok Regional Hub, highlighted the UNDP Framework for an inclusive Whole-of-Society Digital Transformation. He brought the presentation to the context of Lao PDR, focusing on: (1) skills and capacity building; (2) user-centricity and adoption; (3) policy and regulations; (4) institutional framework and collaboration; (5) service delivery and governance; (6) technology and solutions (Figure 2).

#### Figure 2. Digital Maturity Assessment Framework for Digital Government Transformation in Lao PDR.



Source: Debashis N. (2021). DMA Framework for Digital Government Transformation in Laos [PowerPoint slides]. Peer-to-Peer Learning International Workshop on One-Door-Service Centers (ODSCs). August 4, 2021

#### 6.6 Presentations by ODSCs - Challenges, lessons learned, and way forward

Both Bolikhamxay and Bachieng ODSCs shared that their main challenges in operating ODSCs were in three areas: (1) the budget to expand the office facilities to accommodate more departments; (2) the coordination with different departments and (3) the lack of awareness of ODSCs among citizens.

Despite the challenges, Bolikhamxay ODSC had already moved one step ahead to embrace technology in its operations. They had already implemented a document tracking system to ensure that they could provide effective and transparent service delivery to citizens. For Bachieng ODSC, against challenges, it had managed to streamline its service fees and the fee allocations.

#### 6.7 Presentation on ODSC Roadmap

Mr. Phongphon presented the ODSC roadmap derived from a series of consultations with ODSCs in Lao PDR. The roadmap captured key development areas in the timeframe of short-

term, medium-term, and long-term. It would focus on ODSC expansion, workflow streamlining, reporting and dashboard development, digitalization, and communications in the short term. In the medium-term, it would focus on ODSC expansion, digitalization and regulations, and standards improvement. In the long-term, it would focus on digitalization and regulations, and standards improvement.

## 6.8 Closing

**Mr. Sean O'Connell,** Head of Governance, UNDP Lao PDR, expressed his gratitude to all the participants for staying active throughout the day. He also encouraged ODSCs to think out of the box and try different ways of working, especially embracing digital tools and technology in their work. He commented that UNDP stood ready to work closely with UN DESA to support ODSCs in Lao PDR. The achievements over the years that ODSCs had accomplished had certainly provided pathways for ODSCs to continue to improve the public service delivery to citizens more effectively and transparently with people-centric in the heart of their operations.

**Mr. Bokyun Shim,** Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA, recognized the opportunity provided by the National Workshop to discuss the key lessons learned from the peer-to-peer international Workshop and examine how to adopt those findings to the ODCS in Lao. He lauded the top leader's commitment, continued engagement, and innovative spirit to strengthen the ODCS in Lao for effective public service delivery with high satisfaction from the population.

Above all, Mr. Shim mentioned that governments needed to adopt a people-centered approach and put people at the core of public service. A people-centric approach also requires a civil service representative and inclusive of the society its policies and services target. To provide people-centric public services, governments need to develop public ethics law and public officials' ethics codes to monitor and evaluate public servants. Digital transformation of ODSCs and innovation are effective ways to deliver public service as per the needs of the citizens.

# 7. Annex

## 7.1 Evaluation Survey Results

Thirty-two (32) evaluation responses from the representative of different ODSCs were collected following the Workshop.



#### 1. The Workshop enhanced your understanding on:

2. To what extent do you think your participation in the Workshop has provided an opportunity for networking and collaborating with the panelists?



**3.** To what extent did the Workshop improve your capacity to set up institutional arrangements for One Door Service Centers?



Moderate
 Much
 Very Much



#### 4. How would you rate the following elements of the Workshop?

5. How likely are you going to apply what you have learned in the Workshop in practice?



Very Likely
 Likely
 Moderately
 Very Unlikely

# 6. What did you find most useful from the Workshop?

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
Peer-to-peer	• Various sharing. The questions were well-curated;
learning	• Singaporean experience and organized presentation are very helpful;
	• Three lessons learned from 6 countries;
	• The exchange on international and national one-door service center implementation;
	• The lessons learned and feedback exchange on ODSC through the online system of the workshop participants;
	• The implementation and feedback exchanges of each ODSC;
	• Lesson learned for better implementation of ODSC strategic plan in the future in Lao PDR;
	• Lesson learned from foreign countries, languages, and modern technology application;
	• We have a better understanding and experience on OSDC from internally and externally;
	• We have heard the implementation in many countries;
	• Application of each country's lesson to real working circumstances;
	• Each country's presentation to enable to apply with our one door service;

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
	As we have heard lessons and knowledge exchange from
	speakers at this Workshop;
	• Gained more knowledge and experiences;
	• The lessons and experiences compared to the implementation
	of speakers' countries and provinces;
	• The discussion with many countries ;
	• Gained knowledge on one door service with many relevant sectors;
	• The Workshop was really useful. We could gain new
	knowledge and experiences as many countries have their
	lessons and experiences presented during the Workshop;
	• We have insight understanding one door service such as the
	lesson from different countries was very important because we can adapt those lessons with our real-life working of Kaisone
	district;
	• The Workshop was really useful because many countries have
	different lessons, experiences and the implementation of their
	own countries, from which we could learn and gain new
	knowledge;
	• Lessons learned we gained from overseas regarding the
	management of ODSC at international and local levels;
	• The most useful thing for this Workshop was we learned and understood the implementation of one door service of each
	understood the implementation of one door service of each ODSC, including domestic and international ODSC
	participating in this Workshop.
Improvement of	<ul> <li>The Workshop showed that many countries, provinces, and</li> </ul>
ODSCs	districts have ODSC service delivery. Therefore, my district
02005	has to focus on the improvement of this issue;
	<ul> <li>The implementation is not yet centralized;</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Able to apply information, planning, and techniques with our</li> </ul>
	ODSC;
	<ul> <li>Integration, not just coordination.</li> </ul>
Application of	Application of modernized digital system with one door
modernized	service delivery; The lessons on one door service
digital system	implementation of each country;
	• The introduction process, modern methods, and documentation
	process were based on the IT system.

7. What follow-up action(s) will you most likely take in your daily work to implement the knowledge gained from the Workshop?

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
Strengthening	• Developing to be the strategic plan;
the ODSCs	• ODSC implementation;

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
Application of lessons learned	<ul> <li>Participants response/suggestions</li> <li>The organizational structure was not yet integrated, and the work description of each sector should be integrated at one door service to serve the entrepreneurs and citizens;</li> <li>Solving issues and improving the service by making awareness for citizens, entrepreneurs to understand the importance of ODSC, improve the working environment, provide training programs for employees for better service;</li> <li>Ask for feedback from users and propose to the leadership to legislate for the organization respectively;</li> <li>Will propose to the district leadership for some budget and equipment to be used for one door service; Will stimulate offices that apply one door service, pay more attention to the effective working process;</li> <li>Will improve some points that our ODSC is not yet able to do for better service;</li> <li>To improve our working system;</li> <li>Will improve ODSC to be more accessible and comfortable for the citizen;</li> <li>We will apply the working system of each country to adapt to our real working system;</li> <li>Will apply the effective implementation of each ODSC within the country and overseas with ODSC in Vientiane Capital.</li> <li>This Workshop will be applied to the real working process as much as possible;</li> <li>We will try our best to apply the lessons learned from this Workshop with our working system for the most benefit;</li> <li>Yesterday's Workshop was a good lesson to be applied with our organization as much as possible;</li> <li>Application of modernized digital system with ODS; some lessons learned for this Workshop to disseminate for those responsible for ODSC to understand the meaning and importance of ODSC;</li> <li>We will bring the lessons from countries that participated in implementing in the near future, such as mobile service by using a vehicle, ODSC where there are many sectors and modernized IT system application;</li> <li>We will implement the new lessons of those countries in the future, such as the moder</li></ul>

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
	• To be able to apply some methods and techniques with our
	ODSC;
Reporting	• Report the knowledge from this Workshop to the leadership
	level to consider and consolidate activities at different sectors
	as one door service (one-stop service, there should be no
	further service at the office);
	• Report to the provincial leadership for a better understanding
	of the Workshop's content to further explain to understand and
	invite relevant sectors to participate in ODSC as a whole.
Others	• Team building;
	• Look into Korean digital government development;
	• There should be clear regulation or legislation;
	• If our ODSC has sufficient criteria, we will develop our ODSC
	if we have a sufficient budget;
	• Utilizing with ODSC;
	Connect with some speakers directly.

# 8. What is your overall rating of the Workshop?



# 9. Please provide how you think this Workshop might be improved.

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
Offline	• Discussion and off-line meeting workshop would be better to
workshop	help to understand each other;
	• If possible, I prefer to have a face-to-face workshop for the
	next Workshop since it will help us understand easier.

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
Pre-workshop	<ul> <li>Before organizing a video conference (online), I would like to request NGPAR to introduce how to access the workshop link because some ODSCs were able to access it, but some were not able to access it, which can cause difficulty, and when they could assess the link, the Workshop had already started 2 or 3 sessions;</li> <li>We would like to run pre-test 15 minutes before the Workshop;</li> <li>Send the ready document used during the Workshop to the provinces before the Workshop at least one day before.</li> </ul>
Management (translation, time, online platform, etc.)	<ul> <li>If there is another workshop, there should be simultaneous translation;</li> <li>The management was not good enough;</li> <li>We would like to request for the legislative manual;</li> <li>We would like the relevant stakeholders to introduce the use of more modernized equipment;</li> <li>If there is another national workshop, it would be good to have a translation, and we would like to have more time for a discussion session;</li> <li>Overall, this Workshop was very good. If there is another workshop, should improve the time, provide local ODSC some budget for the Workshop;</li> <li>If there is another workshop, we would like the secretariat of ODSC to inform the details of participants and be time punctual;</li> <li>Should increase more time, improve the internet connection;</li> <li>Before the Workshop started, the sound system should be checked as the sound is the main factor of this kind of Workshop;</li> <li>Should give more discussion opportunity of each sector;</li> <li>In order to improve the next Workshop:</li> <li>&gt; The workshop document should be reached to the participant for at least three days;</li> <li>&gt; Set the time and details of the Workshop appropriately;</li> <li>&gt; The intervention of the participants from the locals is too short, should have 15-20 minutes;</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Facilitate some districts that do not yet understand how to use Zoom.</li> </ul>
Budget	• Must provide each provincial ODSC some budget to purchase some equipment.
Presentations	• We would like to present the best ODSC service and lessons learned in Lao PDR;

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
	• Some documentation and planning procedures and methods
	were good to take away to be a sample.
Others	• We would like to have frequent Workshop so that we can
	exchange with each other;
	• Overall, we absolutely agreed. you could organize a very
	workshop;
	Information preparation;
	• The workshop participants for the local level, the leader, or the
	decision-maker to participate. For instance, the district level
	might be the district administrator/mayor or vice mayor.

# 10. What type(s) of additional capacity development support would you like to receive?

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
Legislation	<ul> <li>Law, legislation, budget (money), vehicles for our work, building, ODSC working place;</li> <li>Legislation as the order for all sectors to open one door service at one single service point and be clearer than previous legislation.</li> </ul>
Coordination	• Document dissemination and understanding of leadership level not yet wide enough. In addition, we need training for our staff who is working at ODSC.
Finance	<ul> <li>Good experience, budget;</li> <li>Budget for administration work, technology equipment;</li> <li>We would like the Ministry of Home Affairs to identify specific legislation, particularly the budget to be used at ODSC to make it clear and agreeable across the country;</li> <li>Budget for establishment or improvement of the ODSC;</li> <li>Budget for ODSC improvement of each district.</li> </ul>
Infrastructure	<ul> <li>IT system;</li> <li>IT-based graduates;</li> <li>IT system because we are still weak at IT service system;</li> <li>We would like to have modern technology to apply with our work;</li> <li>Equipment used for the Workshop, especially camera and microphone;</li> <li>IT equipment system for ODSC;</li> <li>Need modern technology to be used for ODSC service such as QR code document scan and so on;</li> <li>Equipment used at the ODSC is IT system;</li> <li>Office equipment such as computer and Wi-Fi installation;</li> <li>Need modern equipment to provide ODSC service;</li> </ul>
Capacity development	• Training for each ODSC;

Theme	Participants response/suggestions
	<ul> <li>Organizing training for the staff who is working and exchanging with a successful ODSC to apply the lesson with their center for better service;</li> <li>Capacity building in terms of using digital with daily work;</li> <li>Need training on modern digital usage one door service implementation;</li> <li>Organizing a training program for those who are in charge of and staff to ODSC;</li> <li>Organizing training programs;</li> <li>Specific business process reengineering on cases of One-stop services design examples.</li> </ul>
Peer-to-peer learning	<ul> <li>Yes, need the international knowledge, from the use of modern technology to exchange knowledge from other countries;</li> <li>Take a field trip to exchange with ODSC where a good model is and conduct training;</li> <li>We would like to be trained with other countries that are successful in bringing knowledge to develop the ODSC of Laos;</li> <li>Field trip for exchange.</li> </ul>
Creating	• Creating advertisements such as brochures, posters, voice clips
awareness	for consensus from the ministry level to local.

# 7.2 Agenda of the Workshops

Peer-to-Peer Learning International Workshop on One-Door-Service Centers (By invitation)		
	<b>4 August 2021, Wednesday, 8:30 – 13:15 (Lao Time)</b> Total: 4 hours 45 min	
Time (Lao Time)	Agenda	
	Overall Moderators: Ms. Adriana Alberti, Mr. Bokyun Shim, and Mr. Keping Yao, DPIDG /UN DESA	
	Opening Remarks	
8:30 – 8:50 (20 min)	H.E. Mr. Thongchan Manixay, Minister of Home Affairs, Lao PDR	
	• <b>Ms. Ricarda Rieger</b> , Resident Coordinator a.i., United Nations Office in Lao PDR	
	• Mr. Juwang Zhu, Director, DPIDG / UN DESA	
8:50 - 9:00	Overview Presentation on One Door Service Centers	
8:50 – 9:00 (10 min)	<b>Mr. Laty Phimmachack,</b> Deputy Director-General, Department of Local Administration, Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA), Lao PDR	
9:00 - 9:25	Overview Presentation on International Experiences of One Door Service Centers	
(25 min)	Mr. Aslam Alam, Chairman, and Executive Director, Bangladesh Institute for Information Literacy and Sustainable Development, Bangladesh	
	Round-table Discussion	
	Session 1: Critical Role of Leadership for Effective One-Door-Service Centers (ODSCs)	
9:25 – 9:45 (20 min)	<b>Moderator: Ms. Adriana Alberti,</b> Chief, Programme Management and Capacity Development Unit, Division for Public Institutions and Digital Government (DPIDG) UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA)	
	Panelists:	
	<b>Mr. Abdul Aliyev,</b> Head, International Relations Department, The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan	

	<b>Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi</b> , Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam
	Questions to Panelists: (15 min)
	Azerbaijan and Vietnam: (7 minutes per country)
	<ul> <li>How has the support from the highest level of government (prime minister, President, or ministers) influenced the functional implementation and improvement of one-stop shops for service delivery?</li> <li>What concrete decisions from the national leadership facilitated inclusive and effective service delivery?</li> <li>What were the key pillars of your country's strategy and roadmap for effective and inclusive service delivery?</li> </ul>
9:45 – 10:05 (20 min)	Q & A for Session 1
	Session 2: Institutional Coordination
	Moderator: Mr. Bokyun Shim, Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA
10:05 – 10:30 (25 min)	Panelists:
	<b>Ms. Junny Kim,</b> Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea
	<b>Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi</b> , Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam
	<b>Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev,</b> Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan
	<b>Mr. Anir Chowdhury</b> , Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh
	Questions to Panelists: (24 min)
	<b>Republic of Korea and Vietnam: (7 minutes per country)</b> The moderator poses the three questions, and then each country responds to all three of them.
	• How does institutional coordination facilitate in practice the successful operation of your country's One-Stop-Shop system, and who is responsible for coordination?
	• How did you promote collaboration mechanisms among government officials?
	<ul> <li>How did you succeed to integrate front office operations with the necessary back-office coordination, and what were the main steps?</li> </ul>

	Azerbaijan and Bangladesh: (5 minutes per country)
	<ul> <li>What are some examples of effective strategies and innovative practices you have utilized in your country for coordination from the national to local level to enhance public service delivery?</li> <li>What challenges did you face, how did you overcome them, and what are the lessons learned?</li> </ul>
10:30 – 10:45 (15 min)	Q & A for Session 2
10:45 - 10:55	Break (10 min)
	Session 3: Structural Organization, Processes, Digitization, and Financing of One-Stop Shops
	<b>Moderator: Mr. Keping Yao,</b> Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert, UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA
	Panelists:
	<b>Ms. Junny Kim,</b> Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea
	<b>Ms. Lee Mui Ling,</b> Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation, of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore
10:55 – 11:40 (45 min)	<b>Mr. Abdul Aliyev</b> , Head, International Relations Department, The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan
	<b>Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi</b> , Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam
	<b>Mr. Anir Chowdhury</b> , Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh
	Questions to Panelists: (45 min)
	Republic of Korea and Singapore (8 minutes per country):
	<ul> <li>How did you undertake a business process re-engineering to transform your one-stop shops into an efficient networked system? How did you eliminate unnecessary documentation to simplify the re-engineering process?</li> <li>What regulatory, legislative, and policy changes did your country adopt to facilitate public service delivery?</li> </ul>

	• What did your country do to ensure that public services are fit for citizens' needs? Please elaborate on your simplification and single-window design approaches.
	Azerbaijan and Vietnam (7 minutes per country):
	<ul> <li>How did you get funding for capital investment (ICT equipment installation, renovation, refurbishment, Mobile Buses, or other elements) for your one-stop-shop facilities and logistics at the national and local levels?</li> <li>What are the financial challenges, and how are you overcoming those challenges?</li> <li>How did you build up your ICT infrastructures, such as IT equipment maintenance and operation? Please elaborate on the operation of the ICT infrastructure.</li> </ul>
	Bangladesh and Singapore (7 minutes per country):
	<ul> <li>What measures has your country undertaken to overcome the digital divide?</li> <li>How did your country introduce digital transformation for OSS?</li> <li>What were the effective strategies for building partnerships with the ICT sector and the private sector for innovative solutions?</li> </ul>
11:40 – 11:55 (15 min)	Q & A for Session 3
	Session 4: Effective National to Local Governance
	Moderator: Mr. Sanva Saephan, Consultant, DPIDG/UN DESA
	Panelists:
	<b>Mr. Ruslan Akbarov</b> , Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan
11:55 – 12:15 (20 min)	<b>Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi</b> , Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam
	<b>Mr. Anir Chowdhury</b> , Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh
	<b>Ms. Lee Mui Ling,</b> Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation, of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore
	Questions to Panelists: (20 min)
	Azerbaijan and Vietnam: (5 minutes per country)
	• What are some examples of effective strategies and innovative practices you have utilized in your country for coordination from the national to local level

	<ul> <li>to enhance public service delivery? What challenges did you face, how did you overcome them, and what are the lessons learned?</li> <li>What are some of the measures and strategies for breaking silos and fostering effective coordination and policy coherence across different agencies of local governments, particularly back offices?</li> </ul>
	Bangladesh and Singapore (5 minutes per country):
	<ul> <li>Are there endorsed coordination and consultation mechanisms in place so that the priorities of sub-national government entities operating ODSCs are systematically integrated into national policy/ strategy formulation and planning processes?</li> <li>Do ODSCs take action and follow up on the feedback they receive from users? If yes, how is this documented and shared with the public?</li> </ul>
12:15 - 12:25 (10 min)	Q & A for Session 4
	Session 5: Monitoring, Reporting, and Evaluation
	Moderator: Mr. Prabin Maharjan, Programme Management Expert, UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA
	Panelists:
12:25 - 12:45	<b>Ms. Junny Kim,</b> Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea
	<b>Mr. Ruslan Akbarov</b> , Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan
	<b>Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi</b> , Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam
(20 min)	Questions to Panelists: (20 min)
	Republic of Korea: (6 minutes per country)
	<ul> <li>How did you define the monitoring and evaluation framework, including Key Performance Indicators: what does success mean?</li> <li>How is user feedback collected, and how is a service culture promoted?</li> <li>How did you communicate the progress to the citizens, lawmakers, and political leaders to continuously get their support?</li> </ul>
	Azerbaijan and Vietnam: (6 minutes per country)
	• Could you please explain the monitoring and reporting mechanisms deployed by the one-stop-shop coordinating institution in your country?

12:45 - 12:55 (10 min)	Q & A for Session 5
12:55 - 13:10 (15 min)	Lessons Learned from the Implementation of One-Stop-Shops for Service Delivery
	<b>Moderator: Mr. Keping Yao,</b> Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert, UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA
	Panelists:
	<b>Mr. Mahammadali Khudaverdiyev,</b> Head of Division, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Azerbaijan
	<b>Mr. Anir Chowdhury</b> , Policy Advisor, Aspire to Innovate (a2i) Programme, Cabinet Division and ICT Division, Bangladesh
	<b>Ms. Junny Kim,</b> Director General, Government Complaints Counseling Center, Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea
	<b>Ms. Lee Mui Ling,</b> Senior Director, Service Delivery, Public Sector Transformation, of the Public Service Division under the Prime Minister's Office, Singapore
	<b>Ms. Vu Thi Kim Chi</b> , Senior Deputy Director, Quang Ninh Investment Promotion Agency, Vietnam
	Questions to Panelists: (15 min)
	Azerbaijan, Bangladesh, Republic of Korea, Singapore, Vietnam:
	Based on your experience of successful operationalization of ODSCs, what are three key lessons learned (in terms of Do's and Don'ts) for effective, inclusive, and accountable One Stop Shops?
13:10 – 13:15 (5 min)	Closing Remarks
	Mr. Bokyun Shim, Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA

National Workshop on Lessons Learned and Next Steps in Implementing the One-Door Service Centers in Lao PDR		
(Closed event, for Lao participants and UN)		
<b>4 August 2021, Wednesday, 14:15 – 16:00 (Lao Time)</b> Total: 1 hour 45 min		
Time (Lao Time)	Agenda	
14:15 – 14:25 (10 min)	Welcome by Ms. Singthavone Dalavong, Head of MOHA office, Lao PDR	
	Welcome by Mr. Sean O'Connell, Head of Governance, UNDP Lao PDR	
	Facilitators: Mr. Bokyun Shim, Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA	
14:25 – 14:35 (10 min)	Debriefing about the International Presentations and Discussions during the Morning Segment	
	<b>Mr. Keping Yao,</b> Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert, UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA	
	Presentations of Checklist for Effective ODSCs	
	<b>Mr. Aslam Alam,</b> Chairman, and Executive Director, Bangladesh Institute for Information Literacy and Sustainable Development (10 min)	
44.25 45.05	Overview Presentation of the Digital Government Capability Assessment	
14:35 – 15:05 (30 min)	Mr. Keping Yao, Senior Governance and Public Administration Expert, UNPOG/ DPIDG/UN DESA (5 min)	
	Highlights of digital government transformation in Lao	
	<b>Mr. Debashis Nag,</b> Regional Digital Transformation Consultant, UNDP Regional Innovation Center in Bangkok Regional Hub, UNDP - Asia Pacific (5 min)	
15:05 – 15:20 (15 min)	Presentations by Bolikhamxay ODSC - Challenges, lessons learned, and way forward	
	Mr. Phoulamphan Thienglamai, Head of Bolikhamxay ODSC	
	Presentations by Bolikhamxay ODSC- Challenges, lessons learned, and way forward	
	Dr. Khamkingkeo Pathommavongm, Deputy District Mayor of Bachieng District	
15:20 – 15:50 (30 min)	Presentation on ODSC Roadmap	
	<b>Mr. Laty Phimmachack,</b> Deputy Director-General, Department of Local Administration, MOHA, Lao PDR	

	After the presentation, ODSCs are invited to provide comments on the roadmap based on the lessons learned in the morning session
15:50 – 16:00 (10 min)	Closing Remarks
	Mr. Sean O'Connell, Head of Governance, UNDP Lao PDR
	<b>Mr. Debashis Nag,</b> Regional Digital Transformation Consultant, UNDP Regional Innovation Center in Bangkok Regional Hub, UNDP - Asia Pacific
	<b>Mr. Bokyun Shim,</b> Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG), DPIDG/UN DESA

#### VIII. Contact Information

#### **UN DESA/DPIDG**

Mr. Juwang Zhu Director Division for Public Institutions and Digital Government (DPIDG) United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA) E-mail: <u>zhu@un.org</u>

Ms. Adriana Alberti Chief, Programme Management and Capacity Development Unit DPIDG/UN DESA E-mail: <u>alberti@un.org</u>

#### Mr. Jonas Rabinovitch

Senior Advisor on Innovation and Public Service Delivery DPIDG/UN DESA E-mail: rabinovitch@un.org

#### **UN DESA/DPIDG/UNPOG**

#### Mr. Bokyun Shim

Head, UN Project Office on Governance (UNPOG) DPIDG/UN DESA E-mail: <u>bokyun.shim@un.org</u>

#### Mr. Prabin Maharjan

Programme Management Expert UNPOG/DPIDG/UN DESA E-mail: <u>prabin.maharjan@un.org</u>